

Molinar, Tess

From: Nina Chomsky <nrchomsky@aol.com>
Sent: Monday, November 30, 2020 12:16 PM
To: Moran, Katherine
Subject: 1483 Arroyo View Drive MCUP Hearing 12/2/2020

CAUTION: This email was delivered from the Internet. Do not click links or open attachments unless you *know* the content is safe. Report phish using the Phish Alert Button. [Learn more...](#)

Ms. Moran,

The Linda Vista-Annandale Association hereby requests a Hearing on the MUCP matter referenced above based on the need, in our view, for additional information on the non-reflective status of the proposed roof.

The last discussion of a proposed metal roof in the Linda Vista area, which also involved Mr. Novak as the Hearing Officer, took place in October, 2018 with respect to 370 N. San Rafael Ave. The most convincing evidence that the proposed metal roof would be non-reflective was material submitted by the Applicant from the non-profit, independent, Cool Roof Ratings Council that compared the proposed metal roofing material to several commonly used roofing materials, including asphalt shingles, of a similar color. The comparative evidence indicated that the proposed metal roofing material would be as non-reflective as commonly used roofing materials of a similar color. The Staff Report from that case is attached for your information. Please see the second page

Here, the evidence appears to be an internal rating system from the manufacturer itself. This information appears not independent, and, maybe, not reliable. We think that independent evidence should be required and submitted, such as independent information from the Cool Roof Ratings Council.

Nina Chomsky,
Linda Vista-Annandale Association



PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

STAFF REPORT

DATE: October 17, 2018

TO: Hearing Officer

SUBJECT: Minor Conditional Use Permit #6659

LOCATION: 370 North San Rafael Avenue

APPLICANT: Susan Masterman

ZONING DESIGNATION: RS-2-HD (Single-Family Residential, 0-2 units per acre, Hillside Overlay District)

GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION: Low Density Residential

CASE PLANNER: Carlos Chacon

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Adopt the Environmental Determination and Specific Findings in Attachment A to **approve** Minor Conditional Use Permit # 6659.

PROJECT PROPOSAL: Minor Conditional Use Permit: to allow the installation of a metal roof on an existing two story, 2,760 square-foot residence. A Minor Conditional Use Permit is required for any metallic finish on the exterior walls and/or roof of any primary structure pursuant to Section 17.40.110 of the Zoning Code.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: This project has been determined to be exempt from environmental review pursuant to the guidelines of the California Environmental Quality Act (Public Resources Code §21080(b)(9); Administrative Code, Title 14, Chapter 3, §15301, Class 1, (Existing Facilities) and there are no features that distinguish this project from others in the exempt class; therefore, there are no unusual circumstances. Section 15301 exempts repair and maintenance of existing private structures where negligible or no expansion of use beyond that existing on site. The proposed project involves the installation of a metal roof on an existing residence and no expansion of the residence is proposed as part of this application. Therefore, the proposal is exempt from environmental review.

BACKGROUND:

Site characteristics: The site is a 19,297 square-foot irregular shaped hillside lot, and is developed with a 2,760 square-foot two-story single-family residence with an attached one-car garage. Currently, the residence is undergoing construction of a 319 square-foot second story addition and a detached 231 square-foot one-car garage at the rear of the property.

Adjacent Uses: North – Single-Family Residential
South – Single-Family Residential
East – Single-Family Residential
West – Single-Family Residential

Adjacent Zoning: North – RS-2-HD (Single-Family Residential, 0-2 units per acre, Hillside Overlay District)
South – RS-2 HD (Single-Family Residential, 0-2 units per acre, Hillside Overlay District)
East – RS-2 HD (Single-Family Residential, 0-2 units per acre, Hillside Overlay District)
West – RS-2 HD (Single-Family Residential, 0-2 units per acre, Hillside Overlay District)

Previous zoning cases on this property: None

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The applicant, Susan Masterman on behalf of the owner, John Naber, has submitted a Minor Conditional Use Permit (MCUP) application to allow the installation of a metal roof on the existing residence and the addition under construction. A Minor Conditional Use Permit is required for any metallic finish on the exterior walls and/or roof of any primary structure pursuant to Section 17.40.110 of the Zoning Code. The subject site is an irregular shaped lot in the RS-2-HD (Single-Family Residential, 0-2 dwelling units per acre, Hillside Overlay) zoning district. The site is characterized by a steep descending slope from the front property line to the rear. Due to this topography, the residence is sited towards the front of the site, approximately six feet from the front property line. As a result, the proposed metal roof would be readily visible from the street.

ANALYSIS:

Minor Conditional Use Permit: to allow the installation of a metal roof on a primary structure

The MCUP process allows the City to review a project and its configuration, design, location, and potential impacts of the use in order to evaluate if the project would be compatible with the surrounding uses, and the suitability of the use to the site.

The applicant is proposing to use non-glare, pre-finished metal (standing seam) roof panels on the existing pitched roof of the residence. Pursuant to Section 17.40.110.B (Reflective Surfaces, Metal Finishes), a MCUP is required for the use of a metallic finish (e.g., exposed metal cladding)

on the roof or walls of a main structure on a property in the RS and RM-12 zoning district in order to evaluate if the project would create a new source of substantial light or glare which would adversely affect the surrounding area.

As indicated by the applicant, the proposed material is manufactured by Berridge and is listed per the Cool Roof Ratings Council, a non-profit organization that evaluates solar reflectance and thermal emittance of roofing products, as comparable to other common surface materials used in residential roofing applications. Based upon the graphic principle that darker colors are less noticeable than light colors, the applicant has proposed a “Charcoal Grey” color with a matte finish for the roof panel. The color proposed would help blend the roof with the natural appearance of the immediate hillside area that includes mature trees with darker foliage. The color would also compliment the dark black window and door frames of the residence.

The following Table 1 was prepared with data from the manufacturer and the Cool Roof Rating Council in order to demonstrate that the proposed material is not more reflective than other common roofing materials utilized for residences:

Table 1 – Reflection Comparison:

Material (color)	Thermal Emittance (2)	Solar Reflectance (1)
Berridge (Charcoal Grey)	0.25	0.83
Concrete Roof Tile (multi-color)	0.35	0.87
Asphalt Shingle (grey)	0.26	0.92
Clay Roof Tile (black)	0.38	0.85

(1) Solar Reflectance: the fraction of solar energy that is reflected by the surface

(2) Thermal Emittance: the relative ability of the surface to radiate absorbed heat

The lower the reflectance number, as indicated in footnote (1) of Table 1.0 above, means that less reflection would occur as compared to other comparable roofing materials; thus the project would not be considered a substantial source of glare and would not adversely affect the surrounding area.

GENERAL PLAN CONSISTENCY:

The subject site is designated as Low Density Residential in the General Plan Land Use Element. The use of the site will remain a single-family residence; therefore, the character of the single-family neighborhood will be maintained. The proposed metal roof will be consistent with adopted General Plan policies, including Policy 21.3 (Residential Neighborhoods – Neighborhood Character), which encourages development to maintain elements of residential street that unify and enhance the character of the neighborhood. The proposed metal roof would not alter the existing character of the neighborhood, as the color and finish is comparable in reflective capability as other common roofing materials in the neighborhood.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:

This project has been determined to be exempt from environmental review pursuant to the guidelines of the California Environmental Quality Act (Public Resources Code §21080(b)(9); Administrative Code, Title 14, Chapter 3, §15301, Class 1, (Existing Facilities) and there are no features that distinguish this project from others in the exempt class; therefore, there are no unusual circumstances. Section 15301 exempts repair and maintenance of existing private structures where negligible or no expansion of use beyond that existing on site. The proposed

project involves the installation of a metal roof on an existing residence and no expansion of the residence is proposed as part of this application. Therefore, the proposal is exempt from environmental review.

REVIEW BY OTHER DEPARTMENTS:

The proposed project was reviewed by the Department of Public Works, Department of Transportation, Fire Department, Building and Safety Division, and Design and Historic Preservation Section. The Department of Public Works provided conditions, which are included in attachment B. The other departments had no comments at this time and would review the project during the building permit plan check process to ensure compliance with applicable code requirements.

CONCLUSION:

The use of a metallic finish on the roof of a main structure in the RS zoning district is permitted through the approval of a Minor Conditional Use Permit application, as indicated in Section 17.40.110 B. of the Zoning Code. Staff concludes that the findings necessary for approving Minor Conditional Use Permit can be made (Attachment A). The proposed project meets all applicable development standards required by the Zoning Code. As designed, the proposed project would not be harmful or detrimental to surrounding properties and to other residences in the immediate neighborhood. Conditions of approval would ensure that the project is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment A: Minor Conditional Use Permit Findings
Attachment B: Recommended Conditions of Approval

ATTACHMENT A
FINDINGS FOR MINOR CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT #6659

Minor Conditional Use Permit: to allow the installation of a metal roof on a primary structure

1. *The proposed use is allowed with a Minor Conditional Use Permit within the applicable zoning district and complies with all applicable provisions of this Zoning Code.* The use of a metallic finish on the roof of a main structure in the RS zoning district is permitted through the approval of a Minor Conditional Use Permit application, as indicated in Section 17.40.110 B. of the Zoning Code. No variances are requested as the improvements comply with the applicable development standards of the RS-2-HD zoning district.
2. *The location of the proposed use complies with the special purposes of this Zoning Code and the purposes of the applicable zoning district.* The use of the site will remain a single-family residence in a Single-Family Residential zone. One of the purposes of the Single-Family Residential zoning district is to ensure adequate light, air, privacy, and open space for each dwelling, and protect residents from the harmful effects of excessive noise, population density, traffic congestion, and other adverse environmental effects. The proposed metal roof is designed with a matte finish and the color proposed is a dark earth tone. The finish and color will minimize glare and visual impacts on the surrounding properties and their residents. Thus, the proposed project's metal roof will not be considered a substantial source of glare that would be harmful. The project will be in compliance with the special purpose and all applicable development standards of the Single-Family Residential zoning district.
3. *The proposed use is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan.* The subject site is designated as Low Density Residential in the General Plan Land Use Element. The use of the site will remain a single-family residence; therefore, the character of the single-family neighborhood will be maintained. The proposed metal roof will be consistent with adopted General Plan policies, including Policy 21.3 (Residential Neighborhoods – Neighborhood Character), which encourages development to maintain elements of residential street that unify and enhance the character of the neighborhood. The proposed metal roof would not alter the existing character of the neighborhood, as the color and finish is comparable in reflective capability as other common roof materials in the neighborhood.
4. *The establishment, maintenance, or operation of the use would not, under the circumstances of the particular case, be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of persons residing or working in the neighborhood of the proposed use.* The proposal is to install a metallic finish on the roof of a two-story single-family residence. The proposed metal roof material is comparable in reflective capability to other common roof materials used for residential buildings; thus the project would not be considered a substantial source of glare and would not be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of persons residing or working in the neighborhood of the proposed use. Additionally, the color proposed would help blend the roof with the natural appearance of the immediate hillside area that includes mature trees with darker foliage. In addition the roof material will be required to adhere to all requirements as they relate to the Zoning Code, fire, and building and safety codes.
5. *The use, as described and conditionally approved, would not be detrimental or injurious to property and improvements in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City.* The proposal is to install a metallic finish on the roof of the existing two-story residence. Approval of the application will not intensify the use of the site as it will remain a single-family residence.

The proposed metal roof will not be detrimental or injurious to the adjacent residential neighborhood. The proposed metal roof will be required to meet all applicable fire safety and building codes requirement to be reviewed during the building permit plan check process. The dark color and matte finish of the metal finish of the roof will not result in any significant light and glare impacts to the surrounding residences.

6. *The design location, operating characteristics, and size of the proposed use would be compatible with the existing and future land uses in the vicinity in terms of aesthetic values, character, scale, and view protection.* The subject site is designated as Low Density Residential in the General Plan Land Use Element. The use of the site will remain a single-family residence; therefore, the character of the single-family neighborhood will be maintained. The proposed metal roof will not change the existing use of the single-family residence and it will continue to be compatible with the existing and future land uses in the vicinity in terms of aesthetic values, character, scale, and view protection. The proposed metal roof will be in line with the residential character of the neighborhood and is appropriate for the architectural style and is compatible with the hillside environment.

ATTACHMENT B
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL FOR MINOR CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT #6659

The applicant or the successor in interest shall comply with the following conditions:

General

1. The site plan, floor plan, elevations, and building sections submitted for building permits shall substantially conform to plans stamped "Approved at Hearing, October 17, 2018," except as modified herein.
2. The right granted under this application must be enacted within 24 months from the effective date of approval. It shall expire and become void, unless an extension of time is approved in compliance with Zoning Code Section 17.64.040.C (Time Limits and Extensions – Extensions of Time).
3. The approval of this application authorizes the installation of a metallic finish on the roof of the existing two-story single-family residence. The metallic finish shall be a dark charcoal-colored roof panels as reviewed (Berridge, Charcoal Grey Kynar 500/Hylar 5000) or equivalent. Final color and material sample shall be reviewed and approved by the Zoning Administrator prior to the issuance of any building permits.
4. The applicant or successor in interest shall meet the applicable code requirements of all other City Departments.
5. The final decision letter and conditions of approval shall be incorporated in the submitted building plans as part of the building plan check process.
6. The proposed project, Activity Number **PLN2018-00345** is subject to the Inspection Program by the City. A Final Zoning Inspection is required for your project prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy or approval of the Final Building Inspection. Contact Carlos Chacon, Current Planning Section, at (626) 744-7123 to schedule an inspection appointment time.

Public Works

7. The existing house sewer connection traverses across the adjoining property at 1074 Glen Oaks Boulevard (APN 5708-001-017) through a non-recorded public utility easement. The existing house sewer connection shall be terminated and shall be re-connected to the public sewer main at San Rafael Avenue with a new six-inch diameter sewer lateral laid at a minimum slope of two percent. In accordance with PMC Chapter 13.24.010, house sewer (lateral) "means that part of the horizontal piping beginning 24 inches from the exterior wall of the building or structure and extending to its connection with the public sewer." The section of house sewer within the public right-of-way - from the property line to the public sewer, or within easement, shall be vitrified clay or cast iron pipe. The house sewer shall meet City Standards as determined by the Department of Public Works, and a permit issued by the Department of Public Works is required for work within the public right-of-way. The construction of all new house sewers shall be completed prior to the issuance of Certificate of Occupancy.
8. The applicant shall protect all existing public facilities and maintain the right of way in good clean condition during the construction. If any damage is proven to be caused by the subject

development, the applicant is responsible for replacing and/or repairing the facilities to the satisfaction of the City, prior to the issuance of Certificate of Occupancy.

9. Prior to the start of construction or the issuance of any permits, the applicant shall submit a Construction Staging and Traffic Management Plan to the Department of Public Works for review and approval. The template for the Construction Staging and Traffic Management Plan can be obtained from the Department of Public Works webpage at: <https://ww5.cityofpasadena.net/public-works/engineering-and-construction/engineering/forms-and-applications/>. A non-refundable flat fee, based on the current General Fee Schedule, is required for plan review and on-going monitoring during construction. This plan shall show the impact of the various construction stages on the public right-of-way (and the private street) including all street occupations, lane closures, detours, staging areas, and routes of construction vehicles entering and exiting the construction site. An occupancy permit shall be obtained from the department for the occupation of any traffic lane, parking lane, parkway, or any other public right-of-way. All lane closures shall be done in accordance with the Manual of Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MUTCD) and California Supplement. If the public right-of-way occupation requires a diagram that is not a part of the MUTCD or California Supplement, a separate traffic control plan must be submitted as part of the Construction Staging and Traffic Management Plan to the department for review and approval. No construction truck idling or staging, material storage, or construction trailer are allowed in the public right-of-way.

No construction truck idling or staging, material storage, or construction trailer are allowed in the public right-of-way. Construction vehicles should only maneuver/turn-around within the project site private property. Construction vehicles shall not be driven over any private street or private driveways. Parking of construction vehicles and construction worker vehicles shall be within the project site private property.

10. All costs associated with these conditions shall be the applicant's responsibility. Unless otherwise noted in this memo, all costs are based on the General Fee Schedule that is in effect at the time these conditions are met. A processing fee will be charged against all deposits.

In addition to the above conditions, the requirements of the following ordinances will apply to the proposed project:

Sidewalk Ordinance - Chapter 12.04 of the Pasadena Municipal Code (PMC)

In accordance with Section 12.04.035, entitled "Abandoned Driveways" of the PMC, the applicant shall close any unused drive approach with standard concrete curb, gutter and sidewalk. In addition, the applicant shall repair any existing or newly damaged curb, gutter and sidewalk along the subject frontage prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy in accordance with Section 12.04.031, entitled "Inspection required for Permit Clearance" of the PMC.

Construction and Demolition Waste Ordinance, Chapter 8.62 of the PMC

The applicant shall submit the following plan and form which can be obtained from the Permit Center's webpage at <http://cityofpasadena.net/PublicWorks/> and the Recycling Coordinator, (626) 744-7175, for approval prior to the request for a permit:

- a. C & D Recycling & Waste Assessment Plan – Submit plan prior to issuance of the permit. A list of Construction and Demolition Recyclers is included on the waste

management application plan form and it can also be obtained from the Recycling Coordinator.

- b. Summary Report with documentation must be submitted prior to final inspection.

A security performance deposit of three percent of the total valuation of the project or \$30,000, whichever is less, is due prior to permit issuance. For Demolition Only projects, the security deposit is \$1 per square foot or \$30,000, whichever is less. This deposit is fully refundable upon compliance with Chapter 8.62 of the PMC. A non-refundable Administrative Review fee is also due prior to permit issuance and the amount is based upon the type of project.

If you have questions regarding the above conditions and requirements of the ordinances, please contact Yannie Wu at (626) 744-3762 or email ywu@cityofpasadena.net.