



**MEETING MINUTES
SPECIAL MEETING
DESIGN COMMISSION
Tuesday, March 8, 2022**

**SPECIAL PUBLIC MEETING AT 4:30 P.M.
Virtual Meeting**

FOR A COMPLETE AND DETAILED RECAP OF THE MEETING, PLEASE VISIT:
<https://www.cityofpasadena.net/commissions/audio-video-recordings/>

1. ROLL CALL- VICE CHAIR SEPULVEDA CALLED THE MEETING TO ORDER AT 4:30PM

Present: Commissioners Toro, Sales, Lipira, Hawthorne, Delgado, Chiao, Carpenter, and Sepulveda

Absent: Commissioner Rao

Staff: Kevin Johnson

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion to approve **February 8, 2022** minutes was moved and seconded by Commissioners Delgado and Carpenter; Commissioner Rao was absent; no opposition, the minutes were approved.

3. ADVISORY REVIEW

444 N. FAIR OAKS AVE. & 425 N. RAYMOND AVE. (COUNCIL DISTRICT 5)

Advisory Review of Planned Development (PD) #40 that proposes the construction of a new two-to-five-story, 213,826 square-foot, 206-unit residential project with subterranean parking. The Commission will also be asked to advise the Planning Commission as to whether the architectural design of the proposed PD is contextual and of high-quality pursuant to Zoning Code Section 17.26.020.C.3.

(Case Planner: Kevin Johnson)

Owner: Throop Children's Trust & Throop Family Trust

Applicant: Summerhill Apartment Communities Investments, LLC

Architect: KTG Architecture + Planning

(This section continued to next page.)

Public Comments: J. Gomes

Commission Comments:

- The Commission is supportive of the establishment of a Planned Development at this location that would provide a number of units that would equate to a maximum density of 87 units per acre on the western (Fair Oaks Avenue) portion of the site (total of 162 units); consistent with the maximum residential density allowed in the General Plan Land Use Diagram for the Medium Mixed Use category. As proposed, the western portion of the project site is within the Medium Mixed Use category and proposes an overall density of 107 units per acre (199 dwelling units), exceeding the density established in the General Plan Land Use Diagram.
- The current site design is responsive to the Commission's Preliminary Consultation comments and more appropriately addresses the adjoining streets. Further study the site design to reduce the larger setback areas along Fair Oaks Avenue, provide entry stoops to the proposed ground-level residences, and eliminate the need for the proposed grade change and ramp along the street edge to better engage with the public realm. The setbacks proposed should be consistent with the recommendations in the draft Fair Oaks/Orange Grove Specific Plan (maximum 10' over 75% of the building frontage) and should be sufficient to balance the building height and incorporate landscaping and mature trees into the setback areas.
- Building heights should more closely correspond to the recommendations in the draft Fair Oaks/Orange Grove Specific Plan by incorporating substantial upper-story step-backs where the buildings exceed 51' in height.
- Refine and integrate the differentiated storefront treatment at the ground-level amenity spaces along Fair Oaks Avenue and Villa Street to provide a more cohesive ground-level expression to the respective buildings. Alternatively, consider additional massing articulation to create cohesive building forms at the storefront locations. Consider incorporating a ground-level commercial component to the project, or ground-level flexible amenity spaces that could be converted to commercial use in the future.
- Further develop the architectural expression of the Fair Oaks Avenue buildings to achieve a residential character that is more consistent with the Main Street Commercial style inspiration. As designed, some of the elevations have an institutional or office building character that should be softened for the proposed residential use. Ensure that the design is reflective of the proposed design inspiration, or identify a different design inspiration that more closely reflects the proposed design, while ensuring an appropriate contextual response.
- Explore the possibility of eliminating bridges across the central pedestrian entry point along Fair Oaks Avenue to maintain an open view corridor to the open space area in the interior of the site.
- The courtyard at the Raymond Avenue portion of the site should be designed to provide usable outdoor space and amenities for the residents of those buildings, in addition to continuing to provide pedestrian access to the proposed units and retaining the proposed barbeque area toward the rear. Explore

massing strategies that would allow for this to be created within the courtyard, with a minimum 20' dimension in both directions.

- Although some minor massing articulation has been incorporated into the Raymond Avenue buildings, further explore ways to relieve the long, relatively unbroken side and courtyard-facing facades and ensure that courtyard-facing entries are articulated with frontage elements.
- Further study the three-story elevation at the westerly terminus of the Raymond Avenue courtyard to incorporate human-scaled elements and ensure an attractive and inviting termination of the view from Raymond Avenue.
- Consider whether the Herkimer Arms building is an appropriate design inspiration for the Raymond Avenue buildings, given that it is starkly different in character from the rest of the block, and was not originally in this location. A sloping roof form with a projecting one-story front porch and without street-facing balconies may be a more appropriate expression in response to these features that appear in multiple buildings within the context on the block. If a flat-roofed design is maintained as proposed, further study the proportions of the massing and of solids-to-voids to ensure they are simple and harmonious.
- High-quality materials should be utilized in the design. On the Fair Oaks Avenue buildings, a high-quality and durable base material that creates texture at the pedestrian level should be employed.
- Reduce the depth of the subterranean garage ramp and incorporate it into building volume rather than being open to the sky.
- Provide diagrams and renderings depicting how the proposed materials will be applied to the buildings.
- Explore further massing and height articulation, as well as building separation, to the Fair Oaks Avenue buildings to better relate to the surrounding context and avoid the appearance of a uniform, symmetrical character along the streetscape. Redistribute the massing to create buildings that are more distinctive from one another. Consider stepping the podium heights to allow for height variation and better street engagement. Look to the nearby Lincoln Properties/Parsons project for ways to successfully achieve this desired character.
- Employ strategies to highlight the entrances to the buildings and project overall. Clarify how visitors will engage with the project, particularly the leasing office.

Motion:

To continue the public hearing to a date uncertain. Moved and seconded by Commissioners Delgado and Hawthorne.

AYES: Commissioners Sales, Lipira, Hawthorne, Delgado, Chiao, Carpenter, and Sepulveda
NOES: None
ABSENT: Commissioner Rao
ABSTAIN: Commissioner Toro
APPROVED: 7-1-0

4. FINAL DESIGN REVIEW

3452-3488 E. FOOTHILL BLVD – (COUNCIL DISTRICT 4)

Construction of a six-story, 233-unit residential project, in three buildings, totaling 213,286 square feet, a five-story above-ground parking structure with 5,570 square feet of ground-level commercial space and exterior remodeling of and small additions to an existing restaurant (Panda Inn).

(Case Planner: Kevin Johnson)

Owner: CFT NV Developments, LLC

Applicant: Mill Creek Development Company LLC

Architect: CallistonRTKL

Public Comments: None

Commission Comments:

- Provide manufacturer specifications of all paving materials and site furnishings.
- Provide details and finish specifications of the water feature in the ground-level residential courtyard.
- The grey stucco wall areas on the east elevation of the parking structure, as well as brick infill walls on all elevations, shall be recessed within the white stucco frame walls and the color or materials transition shall occur at the inside corner of the recess areas. Provide details to depict these conditions.
- The proposed brick cladding throughout the project shall be detailed as masonry bearing walls with corner bricks used at building corners and openings, and the mortar joints shall be struck.
- Provide additional details of an articulated transition between the concrete bases and the brick cladding above at the brick-clad building volumes.
- Provide final imagery for the proposed lenticular graphic display to staff for review and approval. The final imagery shall not constitute signage as defined in PMC Section 17.48.170. In addition, provide final materials and imagery/color specifications for the banner system on the parking structure. The banners shall be a material that is proved to be high-quality and durable.
- Further study the mechanical venting proposed above the parking structure storefront bays to possibly relocate the required venting to avoid the proposed building wall penetrations. If this is found to be infeasible, the vent covers shall be painted to match surrounding wall surfaces, as shall all vent covers in the residential buildings.
- Storefront systems shall be specified as center-glazed to ensure a dimensional mullion profile. Residential windows shall also have dimensional exterior muntins.
- The residential building finishes shall incorporate strategic use of smooth, hand-troweled stucco, such as at the building base or outermost wall surfaces.
- Balcony soffits shall be painted to match the fascia color.

- To ensure the long-term health and sustained growth of the proposed 62-, 72- and 96-inch box trees, a Certified Arborist shall be retained for the proposed development prior to issuance of a building permit, and for a minimum of three years after project completion, who shall provide:
 - A report, prior to the issuance of a building permit, on the required specifications of the soil growing conditions, the recommended watering schedules, and the topsoil conditions of the proposed tree locations. These specifications shall be incorporated into the permitted landscape plans. If the conditions are not suitable for the proposed tree size and/or species, the arborist shall specify an appropriate alternative tree and size.
 - A planting phasing plan in consultation with the project development team, and a tree protection plan, which shall include the City of Pasadena Tree Protection Guidelines dated 5/13/19 (see Attachment E) for the tree transplants during the construction phase. The plan shall specify when during the project construction the trees would be planted and the tree protection measures installed.
 - On-site monitoring of the trees at time of installation, monitoring of tree protection installations in accordance to the tree protection plan, and monitoring of trees during the construction phase. The arborist shall complete and submit to Design & Historic Preservation (DHP) staff the Tree Protection Certification Form in Attachment F upon installation.
 - Long-term monitoring of the health and maintenance of the trees, including growing conditions, for a minimum of three years after issuance of Certificate of Occupancy.
- Approval of a Master Sign Plan shall be required prior to installation of any project-identification, wayfinding or commercial signage on the building.
- The project design shall continue to incorporate the design features outlined in the Health Risk Assessment prepared by ESA, including MERV 16 filtration, a solid and vegetated barrier along the 210 Freeway frontage, and inoperable windows on the south elevation and the east elevation of building B. If any of these measures are determined infeasible or proposed to change at a later date, additional Health Risk Assessment may be necessary to ensure that cancer risks remain below SCAQMD evaluation criteria.
- The project shall comply with all applicable Zoning Code requirements, particularly the items below, prior to issuance of a building permit, unless deviation is authorized by a Zoning entitlement.
 - Provide dimensions of loading space to confirm compliance with the dimensional requirements.
 - Provide locations of bicycle parking.
 - Confirmation that open space provided meets the minimum requirement.
 - Provide dimensions of balconies to ensure they are not less than six feet from a property line.
- The project shall comply with the Model Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance and any changes to the proposed landscape design that may be required shall be reviewed and approved by staff prior to issuance of a building permit.

- The lighting temperature specified on the final plans shall not rise above 3,000 kelvin for all proposed exterior fixtures. Replacement lighting elements should be regulated by maintenance staff in the future.
- Conditions of approval from other City departments were also included in the decision.

Motion:

Approve the application for Final Design Review subject to the proposed conditions of approval, to be further reviewed by staff before issuing permits. Moved and seconded by Commissioners Sales and Toro.

AYES: Commissioners Toro, Sales, Hawthorne, Chiao, Carpenter, and Sepulveda
 NOES: Commissioner Delgado
 ABSENT: Commissioner Rao
 ABSTAIN: Commissioner Lipira
 APPROVED: 6-1-1

5. COMMENTS AND REPORTS FROM STAFF - NONE

6. COMMENTS AND REPORTS FROM COMMISSION - NONE

7. COMMENTS AND REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES


1. Urban Forestry Advisory Committee - (Carpenter)
2. Historic Preservation Commission - (Lipira)
3. **Planning Commission** - (Delgado)
 - Reported that 3 items were discussed at the 2/23 meeting. First, the approval of an addendum for the Capital Improvement Program from FY2022-2026. Second was an information item to review the environmental impact report for Plan Development 39. Also held a public hearing on General Plan Land Use Diagram Amendment for Lincoln Ave Specific Plan which was approved.
4. Transportation Advisory Commission - (Sales)
5. Arts & Culture Commission - (Sepulveda)
6. Concept Design Review Application Subcommittee - (Toro, Rao, Sales)
7. Las Encinas Psychiatric Hospital & Barn Subcommittee - (Carpenter, Sales)
8. 100 West Walnut St. Subcommittee (PARSONS) - (Toro, Chiao)
9. Olivewood (North and South) Subcommittee - (Chiao, Sales)
10. **1336 E. Colorado Blvd Subcommittee** – (Chiao, Carpenter, Sales)
 - Reported that the developers are implementing a lot of the comments that were made by the commission and so you will see a different project when they come back for review by the commission.

11. 1539 East Howard St. (EF Academy) – (Toro, Chiao, Sales)
12. 139 & 150 S. Oak Knoll Ave Subcommittee (Sepulveda, Delgado)
13. 1200 E. California Blvd Subcommittee (Hawthorne, Delgado, Rao)

Projects on Hold

14. 3200 East Foothill Boulevard (SpaceBank) - (Chiao, Carpenter)
15. 130-140 N. Fair Oaks Avenue Subcommittee - (TBD, TBD, TBD)
16. Design Awards Subcommittee – (TBD, TBD)

8. ADJOURNMENT –CHAIR RAO AJOURNED THE MEETING AT 8:41 P.M.



Kevin Johnson, Principal Planner



Michi Takeda, Recording Secretary