



PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

STAFF REPORT

DATE: June 15, 2022

TO: Hearing Officer

SUBJECT: Conditional Use Permit #6953

LOCATION: 83 S. Hill Avenue

APPLICANT: St. Philip the Apostle Church and School

ZONING DESIGNATION: PS (Public and Semi-Public)

GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION: Institutional

CASE PLANNER: Natsue Sheppard

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Adopt the Environmental Determination and the Specific Findings in Attachment A to **approve** the application with the conditions in Attachment B.

PROJECT PROPOSAL: Conditional Use Permit: To allow minor renovations to the St. Philip the Apostle Parish that includes the construction of a new entrance patio, attached canopies, and interior and exterior renovation of the parish center that includes a 56 square-foot addition in floor area. A Conditional Use Permit is required for minor changes that are inconsistent with an approved Master Plan.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: This project has been determined to be exempt from environmental review pursuant to the guidelines of the California Environmental Quality Act (Public Resources Code §21080(b)(9); Administrative Code, Title 14, Chapter 3, §15301, Class 1, Existing Facilities) and that there are no features that distinguish this project from others in the exempt class; therefore, there are no unusual circumstances. Section 15301 specifically exempts the operation, permitting, licensing or minor alteration of existing structures where there is negligible or no expansion of use. The existing parish center building is ancillary to the primary uses on the site, St. Philip the Apostle

school and church facilities. The proposed work constitutes a negligible expansion and modification to the existing use. Therefore, the project is exempt from environmental review.

BACKGROUND:

Site Characteristics: The project site is located on the south side of Green Street between Holliston Avenue on the west and Hill Avenue on the east. The subject parcel represents one of four parcels that collectively make up the St. Philip the Apostle Church and School campus. The approximate five-acre campus is currently developed with buildings for a private school and church, and surface parking.

Adjacent Uses:

- North – Public library, surface parking
- South – Religious facility, single- and multi-family residences
- East – Pasadena City College
- West – Pasadena City College Child Development Center, multi-family residences

Adjacent Zoning:

- North – PS (Public/Semi-Public) and CG (Commercial General)
- South – RM-48 (Multi-Family Residential, 0-48 units per acre)
- East – PS (Public/Semi-Public)
- West – RM-48 (Multi-Family Residential, 0-48 units per acre) and RM-48-PK (Multi-Family Residential, 0-48 units per acre, Parking Overlay District)

Previous Zoning Cases on this Property: Master Development Plan: Establishment of the St. Philip the Apostle Master Development Plan and an amendment to the Zoning Map to change Parcel No. 5736-002-017 from RM-48-PK to PS. Approved July 18, 2005.

Conditional Use Permit #6743: To allow the construction of a two-story, 3,300 square-foot rectory on the St. Philip the Apostle Church campus; and Private Tree Removal to allow the removal of one protected tree (*Schinus terebinthifolius*) on private property. Approved December 18, 2019.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The applicant, Daniel Young, on behalf of the Archdiocese of Los Angeles, has submitted a Conditional Use Permit to allow minor renovations to the St. Philip the Apostle Parish. The proposal includes interior and exterior renovations of the existing parish center building, that includes a 56 square-foot addition in floor area, an entrance patio distinguished with pony walls, a shade trellis, a roofed canopy, landscaping, and a disabled access path. A Conditional Use Permit is required for minor changes that are inconsistent with an approved Master Plan.

ANALYSIS:

St. Philip the Apostle Parish Master Plan of 2005

The St. Philip the Apostle Church and School Master Plan and Zone Change was adopted by the City Council on July 18, 2005. The three-phase Master Plan authorized the demolition of the existing rectory, convent, and apartment building; renovation of the parish center, north school, and south school with no change in the floor area; and construction of a new parish hall, new school, access link, and maintenance building for a period of ten years.

The St. Philip campus underwent a series of phased improvements several years ago as part of implementation of the Master Plan. However, development proposed at later phases had not been completed, and a request for a renewal to extend the sunset date of the Master Plan (July 18, 2015) was not proposed. In such circumstances, any approval for development under the Master Plan that was not exercised or any new buildings or addition to an existing Master Planned property or any development that is inconsistent with the Master Plan requires approval of a new Master Plan or Conditional Use Permit. As a result, a Conditional Use Permit has been requested for the proposed modifications.

Conditional Use Permit – To allow minor changes inconsistent with an existing Master Plan

The purpose of a Master Plan is to reduce processing time and uncertainty for some types of public or semi-public and open space uses by consolidating multiple entitlements, typically several Conditional Use Permits over an extended period, into one process. After a Master Plan is approved, projects that are consistent with the plan do not require an additional entitlement as long as they comply with the Master Plan and other applicable requirements of the Zoning Code. If a project that is inconsistent with the approved Master Plan is proposed, the Master Plan needs to be amended, or for inconsistencies that are determined to be minor, the Director may allow an applicant to apply for a Conditional Use Permit as an alternative to an amendment to the Master Plan. Such minor changes are limited to changes in parking involving 25 or fewer cars or 300 square feet or less of parking area, changes to fences and walls, landscaping changes, minor changes in internal parking lot circulation, structures of 5,000 square feet or less of gross floor area and, other changes determined to be minor by the Director.

The subject site is located in the PS (Public and Semi-Public) zoning district. This zoning district is intended to provide a specific base-zoning district for large public or semi-public land uses, such as institutions, private schools, and churches. The Hearing Officer may approve a Conditional Use Permit to allow the minor renovations after making six findings identified in the Zoning Code. The general purpose is to evaluate compliance with the Zoning Code and General Plan, whether the use would be detrimental or injurious to the neighborhood, and compatibility of the operation with existing and future uses. The Conditional Use Permit process allows the City to specify development standards and may result in recommended conditions or requirements associated with the operation of the use.

The following discussion addresses development standards.

Floor Area:

The existing parish center is 9,726 square feet and was planned to be renovated under the Master Plan with no additional floor area. The proposed project includes interior and exterior renovations of the building that would result in an addition of 56 square feet of floor area.

Interior and exterior renovations of an existing building on a site covered by a Master Plan (without a change in the purposes or uses of the building) is routinely consistent with a Master Plan. However, due to the additional floor area proposed, a review is required. The additional floor area results from the infill of an existing recessed portion of the building at the southerly entrance (28 square feet each for the first and second floor for a total of 56 square feet) in order to enlarge the lobby and landing. The proposed addition of 56 square feet represents less than one percent of the existing floor area and is a minor change.

Setback:

The Master Plan states that the setbacks for structures along Hill Avenue vary depending on the location of the existing structures and range between 15 feet for the existing school and approximately 40 feet for the church. The existing setback on Hill Avenue for the parish center is 19 feet and the project proposes to reduce this setback to eight feet in order to accommodate the proposed shade trellis and roofed canopy. The support structures for the proposed shade trellis and roofed canopy would be located six feet from the building facade. The trellis and canopy are approximately 32 feet wide, and would project up to 11 feet from the building facade, resulting in a new setback of eight feet. The proposed width of the trellis and canopy is less than five percent of the Hill Avenue frontage (645 feet) which is a minor change.

Walls and Fences:

The proposed project includes pony walls that surround and define the new entrance patio. The walls, made of a masonry material, vary in height (approximately 3'4" at worst case) and have a decorative iron-frame railing atop the wall. The Master Plan described that fences and walls may be located within a setback area, with heights consistent with Section 17.40.180 (Walls and Fences) of the Zoning Code.

The proposed height of the wall is comparable to the typical height of a guardrail (3'-6") or commonly seen for a front yard fence (4'). The combination of the materials and the design of the pony walls would be consistent with the materials and design of the building exterior and shade structure proposed for the parish center. In addition, as a recommended condition of approval, a portion of the pony walls, patio, or steps located within the required 25-foot visibility triangle near the intersection of Hill Avenue and Green Street would be limited to a maximum height of 2'-6", in compliance with Section 12.12.020 (Obstructing views prohibited) of the Municipal Code.

Landscaping and Trees:

According to the submitted plans, there would be improvements to the open space surrounding the parish center, which includes new landscaping and access paths. There also are several new street trees shown on the plans. Protection of public trees and planting of trees within the public right-of-way are subject to review by the Department of Public Works. Landscaping within private property will be reviewed by the Planning Department during the building permit plan check process.

According to the tree inventory prepared for the project, no protected tree removal is proposed. The applicant does anticipate removal of one unprotected tree on private property. No other trees are proposed to be removed with this project.

GENERAL PLAN CONSISTENCY:

The land use designation for the project site is Institutional. This designation is for uses and facilities owned and operated by the City or by other public and/or private institutions such as schools, libraries, and hospitals. General Plan Policy 2.9 (Institutional Uses) calls for accommodation of the development of educational, religious, cultural, and similar facilities that enrich the lives of Pasadena's residents. St. Philip the Apostle Church and School has operated at its existing location for approximately 100 years and has improved in a gradual manner. Additionally, Policy 3.3 (Assembly Facilities) requires that assembly facilities for social, cultural, educational, and religious organizations be located, designed, and managed to ensure compatibility and avoid traffic, noise, and other negative impacts with adjoining uses. The proposed renovation of the parish center building would support a long-standing educational and religious institution, thus is in conformance with the goals, policies and objectives of the General Plan.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:

This project has been determined to be exempt from environmental review pursuant to the guidelines of the California Environmental Quality Act (Public Resources Code §21080(b)(9); Administrative Code, Title 14, Chapter 3, §15301, Class 1, Existing Facilities) and that there are no features that distinguish this project from others in the exempt class; therefore, there are no unusual circumstances. Section 15301 specifically exempts the operation, permitting, licensing or minor alteration of existing structures where there is negligible or no expansion of use. The existing parish center building is ancillary to the primary uses on the site, St. Philip the Apostle school and church facilities. The proposed work constitutes a negligible expansion and modification to the existing use. Therefore, the project is exempt from environmental review.

REVIEW BY OTHER CITY DEPARTMENTS:

The proposal was reviewed by the Department of Public Works, Department of Transportation, and Design and Historic Preservation Section. The Department of Public Works did not have any comments. The Design and Historic Preservation Section commented that the building was recently surveyed as ineligible as a historical resource through a Historic Resource Evaluation. As such, the proposed alterations are not subject to historical review. In addition, because the proposed project is a small addition to an existing building, it is exempt from design review. Recommended conditions of approval received are included in Attachment B.

CONCLUSION:

It is staff's assessment that the findings to approve the Conditional Use Permit can be made. The conditions of approval from the approved Master Plan of 2005 would remain in effect, except as superseded by this entitlement. The proposed project consists of minor changes. The site would remain as a religious facility and a private school, and the development of the site would be required to adhere to the approved Master Plan. Further, additional conditions of approval are recommended to address issues associated with the construction and maintenance of the project. Therefore, staff recommends that the Hearing Officer approve the application with the findings in Attachment A and the conditions of approval in Attachment B.

Attachments:

Attachment A: Specific Findings

Attachment B: Recommended Conditions of Approval

ATTACHMENT A
SPECIFIC FINDINGS FOR CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT #6953

Conditional Use Permit – To allow minor changes inconsistent with an existing Master Plan:

1. *The proposed use is allowed with a Conditional Use Permit within the applicable zoning district and complies with all applicable provisions of this Zoning Code.* Per Section 17.61.050.I (Conditional Use Permits and Master Plans) of the Zoning Code, projects that are inconsistent with an approved Master Plan may be reviewed through a Conditional Use Permit. The proposed changes are determined to be minor; thus, in lieu of a Master Plan Amendment, the proposed changes to the approved 2005 St. Philip Master Plan are allowed with a Conditional Use Permit. The proposal includes interior and exterior renovations of the building, an entrance patio distinguished with pony walls, shade trellis and roofed canopy, landscaping, and disabled access path. The project would result in a 56 square-foot increase in the floor area and reduction in a portion of the existing Hill Avenue street setback, from the existing 19 feet to a minimum of 8 feet. The proposed changes will comply with all applicable provisions of the Zoning Code.
2. *The location of the proposed use complies with the special purposes of this Zoning Code and the purposes of the applicable zoning district.* The subject site is located in the PS (Public and Semi-Public) Zoning District, the purpose of which is to provide a specific base-zoning district for large public or semi-public land uses that may not be appropriate in other base zoning districts. The location of the proposed changes are minor, will occur on private property, and all conditions of approval for the Master Plan will remain in effect. As conditioned, the proposed changes to the Master Plan will be in conformance with the intent of the Master Plan; thus consistent with the special purposes of the Zoning Code.
3. *The proposed use is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan.* The land use classification for the project site is Institutional. The land use designation for the project site is Institutional. This designation is for uses and facilities owned and operated by the City or by other public and/or private institutions such as schools, libraries, and hospitals. General Plan Policy 2.9 (Institutional Uses) calls for accommodation of the development of educational, religious, cultural, and similar facilities that enrich the lives of Pasadena's residents. St. Philip the Apostle Church and School has operated at its existing location for approximately 100 years and has improved in a gradual manner. Additionally, Policy 3.3 (Assembly Facilities) requires that assembly facilities for social, cultural, educational, and religious organizations be located, designed, and managed to ensure compatibility and avoid traffic, noise, and other negative impacts with adjoining uses. The proposed renovation of the parish center building would support a long-standing educational and religious institution, thus is in conformance with the goals, policies and objectives of the General Plan
4. *The establishment, maintenance, or operation of the use would not, under the circumstances of the particular case, be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of persons residing or working in the neighborhood of the proposed use.* The St. Philip the Apostle Church and School has been a fixture to the community for many years, with the parish center building on the site since 1961. The proposed project will improve and update the existing building and open space amenities. The existing use of the property will remain and continue to serve the community. Conditions of approval will ensure that the continued operation of the campus not be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of the inhabitants in the surrounding area.

5. *The use, as described and conditionally approved, would not be detrimental or injurious to property and improvements in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City.* The proposed changes to the approve Master Plan are considered minor. Since founded at this location many years ago, St. Philip the Apostle has expanded and coexisted with surrounding residential uses. The project must adhere to the City's and State's law that ensure the continuity of the compatible coexistence of this use with surrounding use. With the conditions of approval, there would be not detriment or injury to property and improvements in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City.

6. *The design, location, operating characteristics, and size of the proposed use would be compatible with the existing and future land uses in the vicinity, in terms of aesthetic values, character, scale, and view protection.* The proposed project will update the existing parish center building, landscaping, and its open space amenities. The minor changes will refresh the design and aesthetic of the existing parish center building while maintaining the architectural style, location, function, and general size. The improvements will compliment other buildings on-site and in the vicinity in terms of aesthetic values and character.

ATTACHMENT B
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL FOR CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT #6953

The applicant or successor in interest shall meet the following conditions:

General

1. The site/floor plans submitted for building permits and/or future development shall substantially conform to the site/floor plans site plan submitted with this application and dated, "Approved at Hearing, June 15, 2022," except as modified herein.
2. The approval of this application authorizes the interior and exterior renovations of the parish center building, a 56 square-foot addition, an entrance patio distinguished with pony walls, a shade trellis and a roofed canopy, landscaping, and disabled access path on the northeast portion of the St. Philip the Apostle campus, as shown on the approved plans.
3. The St. Philip the Apostle Parish Master Plan and all Conditions of Approval on July 18, 2005 (Resolution 8498) shall remain in full effect, with the exception of modifications made by Conditions of Approval related to this approval.
4. In accordance with Section 17.64.040 of the Pasadena Municipal Code (PMC), the exercise of the right granted under this application must be commenced within three years of the effective date of the approval. This approval is eligible for two one-year extensions. Each one-year extension is required to be reviewed and approved by the Hearing Officer at a noticed public hearing. In order for a project to be eligible for a time extension, the applicant is required to submit the required fee and time extension application to the Permit Center prior to the expiration date of the land use entitlement. The right granted by this approval may be revoked if the entitlement is exercised contrary to the conditions of approval or if it is exercised in violation of the Zoning Code.
5. Any change to these Conditions of Approval or expansion of the use shall require the modification of this Conditional Use Permit, a new Conditional Use Permit, or amendment to the Master Plan.
6. The Zoning Administrator, at any time, can call for a review of the approved conditions at a duly noticed public hearing. At his/her discretion, the conditions herein may be modified or new conditions applied to reduce any unforeseen impacts during construction or operation of the use.
7. The applicant or successor in interest shall meet the applicable code requirements of all other City Departments.
8. The final decision letter and Conditions of Approval shall be incorporated in the building plans as part of the building plan check process.
9. The proposed project, Activity Number **ZENT2021-00145**, is subject to a Final Zoning Inspection. A Final Zoning Inspection is required for the project prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy. Contact the Planning Case Manager, Natsue Sheppard at (626) 744-7527 to schedule an inspection appointment time.

Planning Division

10. The parish center shall maintain a minimum setback of eight feet from the Hill Avenue property line. Roof overhangs, eaves or similar may project into the setback to the satisfaction of the Zoning Administrator.
11. The maximum additional floor area for the parish center shall be 56 square feet.
12. The Zoning Administrator, at any time, may request to implement new or additional noise reduction measures to reduce any unforeseen impacts with the operation of the cooling towers.
13. A final tree inventory prepared by a certified arborist shall be submitted with a building permit application for any construction that requires removal of trees. If protected private trees are proposed to be removed, pursuant to Pasadena Municipal Code Chapter 8.52, the applicant shall submit an application for Private Tree Removal Permit indicating which of the Tree Protection Ordinance findings apply to the removal(s), including the possibility of requiring a new or revised conceptual landscaping plan indicating the location of required replacement trees.
14. Prior to removal of any protected private trees, the applicant or successor in interest shall submit final landscape plans, demonstrating adherence to the replacement matrix adopted by resolution the City Council and included in the associated administrative guidelines and/or alternative requirements, to the Zoning Administrator for review and approval. Compliance with the Tree Protection Ordinance will be monitored through the approved landscape plan depicting replacement trees during the building plan check phase of the project.
15. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a Tree Protection Plan with a final landscape plan to the Zoning Administrator for review and approval. The Tree Protection Plan shall be prepared by a licensed landscape architect and/or certified arborist in compliance with the City's Tree Protection Guidelines.
16. The applicant or successor in interest shall submit landscape and irrigation plans as part of any building, grading or zoning permits. Where proposing more than 2,500 square feet of new landscaping, the project shall meet the threshold for state-mandated water-efficient landscaping. Accordingly, the final landscape plans (inclusive of planting and hardscape plans, the planting pallet, drainage plan, and irrigation system plan(s) and specifications), shall be reviewed by Planning and Community Development Department staff for conformance with the standards and requirements specified within the 2015 California Model Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance (MWELo) prior to the issuance of a building permit. No certificate of occupancy shall be issued until such plans have been deemed compliant with the MWELo and the landscaping has been installed per such approved MWELo-compliant plans to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning and Community Development or his/her designee.

Department of Transportation

17. The applicant shall comply with Section 12.12.020 of Pasadena Municipal Code (Obstructing views prohibited). The applicant shall maintain the Hill Avenue and Green

Street corner of the site with a 25-foot visibility triangle, and any improvement or obstruction within the triangle shall not be greater than 2'-6" in height.