



## PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

### STAFF REPORT

**DATE:** NOVEMBER 1, 2022

**TO:** HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

**FROM:** JENNIFER PAIGE, AICP, ACTING DIRECTOR OF PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

**SUBJECT:** CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
NEW FRONT PORCH PERGOLA AND EXTENSION OF EXISTING PORCH  
WITH NEW RAILING AND STONE VENEER  
1246 MAR VISTA AVENUE (BUNGALOW HEAVEN LANDMARK &  
HISTORIC DISTRICTS)

---

#### **RECOMMENDATION:**

The staff recommends that the Commission:

#### **Environmental Determination**

Find that the proposed project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to 15301, Class 1, of the CEQA guidelines pertaining to existing facilities such as the existing single-family dwelling and that there are no features that distinguish this project from others in the exempt class.

#### **Finding for Compliance with the Tree Protection Ordinance**

Find that no protected native, specimen, or landmark trees under the tree protection ordinance (Pasadena Municipal Code (PMC) Ch.8.52), will be removed by the new construction.

#### **Finding for Certificate of Appropriateness Approval**

Find that, upon implementation of the recommended conditions of approval, the project will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Illustrated Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, the Design Guidelines for Historic Districts and the Bungalow Heaven Conservation Plan; and,

Based on these findings, approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as illustrated in Attachment B, subject to the conditions of approval outlined in Attachment A, which shall be subject to staff review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.

### **BACKGROUND:**

This one-story, single-family English Revival cottage was constructed in 1922 by Lewis C. Preston and designed by G. Lawrence Stimson. The property is a contributing structure to the designated Bungalow Heaven Landmark & Historic Districts. The house features an L-shaped footprint, stucco exterior, steeply pitched complex hipped and side gabled roof forms with a raised recessed entry and corresponding shed roof covering extending from the main roof slope at a shallower pitch and supported by carved wood posts and beams with visible joinery and solid brackets. The house also has punched wood multi-light casement window openings at the front façade, wood multi-light double hung and casement windows at the sides visible from the street, decorative shutters and a side chimney clad in stucco. The simply designed home does not feature any applied architectural detailing. Permit records indicate that the building has undergone minimal documented alterations since construction, including re-roofing, electrical upgrades, a new driveway gate, and side property line walls.

### **PROJECT DESCRIPTION:**

The applicant proposes to modify the existing concrete porch, at the front, to extend to the edge of the south elevation and to be comprised of similar concrete to that of the existing. The front and side faces of the porch are proposed to be finished with incorporated Arroyo stones that are currently extant in landscape design at the general footprint of the proposed porch. The south side of the new porch is proposed to include a new metal railing in a simplified design similar to that of the existing driveway fence and gate. The applicant also proposes to construct a wood pergola covering across the extended porch. The pergola would be constructed of 4" by 4" Douglas fir posts, a 4" x 8" Douglas fir header and 2" by 4" redwood overhead slats. The finish paint or stain proposed is not specified in the plans; however, the applicant has indicated to staff that it would be either painted to match the color scheme of the house or stained a natural stain.

### **ANALYSIS:**

Pursuant to PMC Section 17.62.090(E)(4), approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be based on the following finding:

- b) If a project is an alteration or new construction, the project complies with the Secretary's Standards and any adopted guidelines based on the Secretary's Standards.

The project was reviewed using the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the Design Guidelines for Historic Districts, which are based on the Secretary's Standards and the Bungalow Heaven Conservation Plan. The applicable standards and guidelines include:

### **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

*Standard 2: The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial*

*relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

*Standard 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

*Standard 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

**Design Guidelines for Historic Districts:**

*7.2: New porch posts should be in scale and proportion to those used historically.*

*7.3: If a complete new porch is necessary, reconstruct it to match the original in form and detail. Use materials similar to the original.*

As conditioned, the proposed project will comply with the applicable guidelines. The proposed porch extension, railing and pergola will be simple alterations completed in a compatible yet differentiated manner. The materials and finishes will be consistent with those found on the house and will be constructed in a manner such that they would be easily removed in the future without affecting the significance of the property. Staff is concerned that the proposed inclusion of Arroyo stone cladding at the base foundation wall of the porch would be a conjectural feature that would create a false sense of historical development and, therefore, recommends a condition of approval requiring the applicant to maintain an unfinished concrete porch wall. Staff is also recommending additional conditions of approval to ensure a matte finish to the railing to ensure consistency with historical metalwork, that the finish or color of the proposed pergola be neutral or otherwise consistent with the house and that additional dimensions and details be included in the plans submitted for a building permit, including concealment of all joinery and hardware.

**CONCLUSION:**

With the recommended conditions of approval, the proposed project will comply with the applicable guidelines, and will promote the rehabilitation of a contributing structure to the landmark district, while providing a pergola for the purposes of sun shading to ensure the protection of historical windows at the primary elevation and continued historical use of the property as a single-family residence. Therefore, staff finds that the project meets the findings and recommends approval subject to the recommended conditions in Attachment A.

Respectfully Submitted,



---

for Jennifer Paige, AICP  
Acting Director of Planning and  
Community Development

Prepared by:



---

Stephanie Cisneros  
Senior Planner

Reviewed by:



---

Kevin Johnson  
Principal Planner

Attachments:

- A. Recommended Conditions of Approval
- B. Architectural Plans
- C. Photographs