Appendix B

Historical Resources Technical Report
This page intentionally left blank.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0 Introduction

2.0 Project Description
   2.1 Project Location
   2.2 Project Overview

3.0 Existing Conditions
   3.1 Site Description

4.0 Regulatory Review
   4.1 Historical Resources under CEQA
   4.2 Historic Designations
   4.3 Central District Specific Plan
   4.4 Historic Significance and Integrity

5.0 Identification of Potential Historic Resources
   5.1 Pasadena YWCA
   5.2 Pasadena Civic Center National Register Historic District
   5.3 Pasadena Civic Center Financial National Register Historic District
   5.4 Other Potential Cultural Resources

6.0 Potential Historical Impacts
   6.1 Framework for Analysis
   6.2 Impacts from Rehabilitation of the Pasadena YWCA
   6.3 Impacts from New Construction Adjacent to the Pasadena YWCA
   6.4 Impacts from New Construction in the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District
**1.0 INTRODUCTION**

Kimpton Hotel and Restaurant Group, LLC (the “Applicant”) is proposing the rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of the existing YWCA building in the City of Pasadena (the “Project”). The Pasadena YWCA is located at 78 North Marengo Avenue, which is within the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District (the “Project Site”).

The purpose of this technical report is to determine if historical resources as defined by the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) are present on or adjacent to the Project Site and, if so, to identify potential impacts to historical resources by the proposed Project. This report is intended to inform environmental review of the proposed Project.

Under CEQA the potential impacts of a project on historical resources must be considered. The purpose of CEQA is to evaluate whether a proposed project may have a significant adverse effect on the environment and, if so, if that effect can be reduced or eliminated by pursuing an alternative course of action or through mitigation measures.

The impacts of a project on an historical resource may be considered an environmental impact. CEQA states that:

A project that may cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource is a project that may have a significant effect on the environment.²

Thus, an evaluation of project impacts under CEQA requires a two-part inquiry: (1) a determination of whether the project site contains or is adjacent to a historically significant resource or resources, and if so, (2) a determination of whether the proposed project will result in a “substantial adverse change” in the significance of the resource or resources. This report investigates the proposed Project Site to determine if historical resources exist either within or adjacent to its boundaries, and analyzes project impacts for any adverse change in the significance of such resources.

This report contains:

- A review of the existing properties within, adjacent to, and in the near vicinity of the Project Site.
- A review of any previous evaluations of properties on or in the vicinity of the Project Site through historic survey or other official action.
- Analysis and evaluation of any potential historic resources.

---

¹ California PRC, Section 21084.1.
² Ibid.
• Review of the required consideration of historic resources under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

• Analysis of potential adverse effects of the proposed Project to historic resources and suggested mitigation measures.

This report was prepared using sources related to the Project Site’s development. The following primary and secondary sources were consulted:

• Sanborn Fire Insurance maps

• Historic photographs, aerial photographs, and local histories

• National Register of Historic Places Inventory nomination forms

• Architectural and Historical Inventory, City of Pasadena

• List of Designated Historic Properties, City of Pasadena

• Archival sources from the Pasadena Museum of History

• Local History Collection, the Pasadena Star-News Archives, and the Los Angeles Times Archives.

Research, field inspection, and analysis were performed by Peyton Hall, Managing Principal; Paul Travis, Principal; and Laura Janssen, Senior Architectural Historian, all qualified professionals who meet or exceed the Secretary of the Interior’s Professional Qualification Standards.³

2.0 PROJECT DESCRIPTION

2.1 Project Location

The City of Pasadena is located approximately 10 miles northeast of the City of Los Angeles in the County of Los Angeles. Regional access to the City is provided by State Route 134 (SR 134), Interstate 210 (I-210 or Foothill Freeway), State Route 110 (SR 110), and Interstate 710 (I-710). The Project location is identified in Figure 1.

The Project Site is bounded by Marengo Avenue to the west, Holly Street to the north, Garfield Avenue to the east, and Union Street to the south. Current uses on the project site include the existing vacant YWCA building located on northeast corner of Marengo Avenue and Union Street; a surface parking lot east of the existing YWCA building; and landscaping and public art (Robinson Memorial) along Holly Street and Garfield Avenue.

It is located in Pasadena’s Central Business District, which is governed by the Central District Specific Plan. It is within the identified boundaries of the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District, which was listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1980. The Project Site is identified in Figure 2.

2.2 Project Overview

The proposed project involves the rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of the existing 40,570-square-foot YWCA building located at 78 N. Marengo Avenue and the addition of an approximately 87,342-square-foot, three- to six-story building on the project site, which together would become an approximately 127,912-square-foot, approximately 179-room, Kimpton Hotel. Constructed from 1921-23, the existing YWCA building is a historically significant property that is listed as a contributor to the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District in the National Register of Historic Places, and the California Register of Historical Resources, and is a City-designated historic monument. However, the building is currently unutilized and has been vacant for several decades. Due to years of lack of maintenance and the possibility of demolition by neglect, the City acquired the property in 2012 through a negotiated settlement for purposes of rehabilitation of the building to return it to active use.

The new hotel would consist of approximately 179 guestrooms and suites, approximately 11,166 square feet of meeting facilities, ballroom space, hospitality parlors, and a restaurant.

The ground floor of the existing YWCA building would undergo rehabilitation to house uses similar to what historically existed in the building. For instance, the

---

4 Description of existing conditions and the proposed project as provided by the Applicant.
existing YWCA lobby would become the hotel lobby and registration space, the existing YWCA library would become the hotel “living room” or common room, the existing YWCA cafeteria would become the hotel restaurant, and the existing YWCA gymnasium and pool spaces would become the hotel ballrooms. Typical guestrooms in the new hotel would be approximately 220 to 400 square feet in size with Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) guestrooms and suites approximately 400 to 600 square feet in size.

The second and third floors of the existing YWCA building would be rehabilitated into 13 guestrooms and suites ranging between 300 and 485 square feet. In addition, the second floor would include hotel meeting rooms with support spaces (i.e., storage, pantry, and prefunction support space). The roof level above the existing gymnasium and pool complex would be structurally strengthened and converted into an outdoor, rooftop pool area. The existing YWCA building basement would provide for kitchen storage, general storage, mechanical rooms and administrative function space.

Separate and adjacent to the YWCA building would be a new three- to six-story hotel building containing approximately 166 hotel rooms. The new hotel structure would be set back 20.25 feet from the Garfield Avenue sidewalk on the east, with a variable setback along Union Street ranging from zero to three feet in length measured from the Union Street sidewalk. The proposed height, floor area ratio, and setbacks meet the development standards for the CD-2 zoning district.

A total of 61 trees are located on the project site, and the Parks and Natural Resources division of the Public Works Department has determined that all of the trees meet the City’s protection criteria because the City owns the property. The proposed project would result in the removal and either relocation or replacement of 34 trees protected under the City’s ordinance. Additionally, a portion of the existing landscaping on the northeast portion of the site would be removed to accommodate construction of the new hotel building. However, the existing Robinson Memorial public art installation would not be affected by the project.

Parking for the new hotel would be valet only. All parking would be off-site and would be provided at existing parking lots and structures in the nearby area. In addition, a turnout is proposed along Marengo Avenue for guest drop-off, valet parking, and access to the main entrance of the hotel and restaurant. A curb cut would be required along Union Street at the service entrance, which would be set back approximately 150 feet east from the intersection of Marengo Avenue.
and Union Street. A secondary entrance/exit for the hotel and meeting functions would be located on Holly Street with a north-south-oriented walkway proposed for traversing existing lawn and landscaping. Similarly, a third entrance/exit for the hotel would be on Union Street between the existing YWCA building and the proposed new addition to the east.
3.0 EXISTING CONDITIONS

3.1 Site Description

The Project Site is located at 78 N. Marengo Avenue in the City of Pasadena, within the County of Los Angeles. The Project Site is relatively flat and approximately 84,042 square feet in size. Current uses on the Project Site include the existing vacant, historic YWCA building located on northeast corner of Marengo Avenue and Union Street; a surface parking lot east of the existing YWCA building; and landscaping and public art (Robinson Memorial) along Holly Street and Garfield Avenue.

A total of 61 trees are located on the Project Site, all of which qualify as public trees that are afforded protection by the City Trees and Tree Protection Ordinance. The Project Site is located within the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District, within the Civic Center area of the Central District Specific Plan, and is zoned CD-2. The General Plan Land Use designation for the site, as adopted on August 17, 2015, is Medium Mixed Use.

The Project Site is located within an urban area, south of the Foothill Freeway (I-210) and east of South Arroyo Parkway (I-110) in the western portion of the City. Landmarks and destinations near the Project Site include the First Baptist Church (across Marengo Avenue to the west), Memorial Park and the Memorial Park Station of the Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority (Metro) Gold Line (one block west), Pasadena Public Library (two blocks north), Pasadena City Hall (across Garfield Avenue to the east/northeast), and Paseo Colorado (one block south). The Robinson Memorial, a public art installation commemorating Jackie and Mack Robinson, is located at the northeast corner of the project site. The Project Site is also located in, and identified as a contributor to, the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District, which is listed in the National Register of Historic Places.

The Project Site is located within the City’s Central District Specific Plan area, which encompasses 960 acres corresponding to the areas recognized by Pasadena residents as “downtown.” Included within the boundaries of the Specific Plan area are activity centers known as Old Pasadena, the Civic Center, the Playhouse District, and South Lake Avenue. The Project Site is located within the Civic Center/Midtown Sub-District, which is the governmental center of the City with various civic, cultural and public service institutions. In addition, the Project Site is located within the planning precinct concept of the Civic Center Core, specifically emphasizing public institutions and mixed-use.

Site photographs are included in Appendix A.
4.0 REGULATORY REVIEW

4.1 Historical Resources under CEQA

CEQA requires that environmental protection be given significant consideration in the decision making process. Historical resources are included under environmental protection. Thus, any project or action which constitutes a substantial adverse change to a historical resource also has a significant effect on the environment pursuant to the State CEQA Guidelines.

When the California Register of Historical Resources was established in 1992, the Legislature amended CEQA to clarify which cultural resources are significant, as well as which project impacts are considered to be significantly adverse. A “substantial adverse change” means “physical demolition, destruction, relocation, or alteration of the resource or its immediate surroundings such that the significance of an historical resource would be materially impaired.”

CEQA defines a historical resource as a resource listed in, or determined eligible for listing, in the California Register of Historical Resources. All properties on the California Register are to be considered under CEQA. However, because a property does not appear on the California Register does not mean it is not significant and therefore exempt from CEQA consideration. All resources determined eligible for the California Register are also to be considered under CEQA.

The courts have interpreted CEQA to create three categories of historical resources:

- **Mandatory historical resources** are resources “listed in, or determined to be eligible for listing in, the California Register of Historical Resources.”

- **Presumptive historical resources** are resources “included in a local register of historical resources, as defined in subdivision (k) of Section 5020.1, or deemed significant pursuant to criteria set forth in subdivision (g) of Section 5024.1” of the Public Resources Code, unless the preponderance of the evidence demonstrates that the resource is not historically or culturally significant.

- **Discretionary historical resources** are those resources that are not listed but determined to be eligible under the criteria for the California Register of Historical Resources.

To simplify the first three definitions provided in the CEQA statute, an historical resource is a resource that is:

---

5 State CEQA Guidelines Section 15064.5(b)(1).

• Listed in the California Register of Historical Resources (California Register);

• Determined eligible for the California Register by the State Historical Resources Commission; or

• Included in a local register of historical resources.

Section 15064.5 of the CEQA Guidelines (California Code of Regulations, Title 14, Chapter 3) supplements the statute by providing two additional definitions of historical resources, which may be simplified in the following manner. An historical resource is a resource that is:

• Identified as significant in an historical resource survey meeting the requirements of Public Resources Code 5024.1 (g);

• Determined by a Lead Agency to be historically significant or significant in the architectural, engineering, scientific, economic, agricultural, educational, social, political, military, or cultural annals of California. Generally, this category includes resources that meet the criteria for listing on the California Register (Pub. Res. Code SS5024.1, Title 14 CCR, Section 4852).

The fact that a resource is not listed in, or determined eligible for listing in, the California Register, not included in a local register of historical resources, or not deemed significant pursuant to criteria set forth in subdivision (g) of Section 5024.1, does not preclude a lead agency from determining that the resource may be an “historical resource” for purposes of CEQA.

Properties formally determined eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places are automatically listed in the California Register. Properties designated by local municipalities can also be considered historical resources. A review of properties that are potentially affected by a project for historic eligibility is also required under CEQA.

4.2 Historic Designations

A property may be designated as historic by national, state, and local authorities. In order for a building to qualify for listing in the National Register or the California Register, it must meet one or more identified criteria of significance. The property must also retain sufficient architectural integrity to continue to evoke the sense of place and time with which it is historically associated.

National Register of Historic Places

The National Register of Historic Places is an authoritative guide to be used by Federal, State, and local governments, private groups and citizens to identify the Nation’s cultural resources and to indicate what properties should be
considered for protection from destruction or impairment. The National Park Service administers the National Register program. Listing in the National Register assists in preservation of historic properties in several ways including: recognition that a property is of significance to the nation, the state, or the community; consideration in the planning for federal or federally assisted projects; eligibility for federal tax benefits; and qualification for Federal assistance for historic preservation, when funds are available.

To be eligible for listing and/or listed in the National Register, a resource must possess significance in American history and culture, architecture, or archaeology. Listing in the National Register is primarily honorary and does not in and of itself provide protection of an historic resource. The primary effect of listing in the National Register on private owners of historic buildings is the availability of financial and tax incentives. In addition, for projects that receive Federal funding, a clearance process must be completed in accordance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. Furthermore, state and local regulations may apply to properties listed in the National Register.

The criteria for listing in the National Register follow established guidelines for determining the significance of properties. The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects:

A. That are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or

B. That are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or

C. That embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or

D. That have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

In addition to meeting any or all of the criteria listed above, properties nominated must also possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association.

---

7 36CFR60, Section 60.2.
8 36CFR60, Section 60.3.
Historic Districts

Standard preservation practice evaluates collections of buildings from similar time periods and historic contexts as historic districts. The National Park Service defines a historic district as “a significant concentration, linkage, or continuity of sites, buildings, structures, or objects united historically or aesthetically by plan or physical development.”\(^9\) A historic district derives its significance as a single unified entity.

According to the National Park Service, “a district can comprise both features that lack individual distinction and individually distinctive features that serve as focal points. It may even be considered eligible if all of the components lack individual distinction, provided that the grouping achieves significance as a whole within its historic context. In either case, the majority of the components that add to the district’s historic character, even if they are individually undistinguished, must possess integrity, as must the district as a whole.” Some examples of districts include business districts, college campuses, large estates, farms, industrial complexes, residential areas and rural villages.\(^10\)

Resources that have been found to contribute to the historic identity of a district are referred to as district contributors. Properties located within the district boundaries that do not contribute to its significance are identified as non-contributors.

California Register of Historical Resources

The California Register is an authoritative guide in California used by State and local agencies, private groups, and citizens to identify the State’s historic resources and to indicate what properties are to be protected, to the extent prudent and feasible, from substantial adverse change.\(^11\)

The criteria for eligibility for listing in the California Register are based upon National Register criteria. These criteria are:

1. Associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of local or regional history or the cultural heritage of California or the United States.
2. Associated with the lives of persons important to local, California or national history.
3. Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region or method of construction.


\(^10\) Ibid.

\(^11\) California PRC, Section 5023.1(a).
or represents the work of a master or possesses high artistic values.

4. Has yielded, or has the potential to yield, information important to the prehistory or history of the local area, California or the nation.

The California Register consists of resources that are listed automatically and those that must be nominated through an application and public hearing process. The California Register includes the following:

- California properties formally determined eligible for (Category 2 in the State Inventory of Historical Resources), or listed in (Category 1 in the State Inventory), the National Register of Historic Places.

- State Historical Landmarks No. 770 and all consecutively numbered state historical landmarks following No. 770. For state historical landmarks preceding No. 770, the Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) shall review their eligibility for the California Register in accordance with procedures to be adopted by the State Historical Resources Commission (commission).

- Points of historical interest which have been reviewed by the OHP and recommended for listing by the commission for inclusion in the California Register in accordance with criteria adopted by the commission.\(^\text{12}\)

Other resources which may be nominated for listing in the California Register include:

- Individual historical resources.

- Historic resources contributing to the significance of an historic district.

- Historic resources identified as significant in historic resources surveys, if the survey meets the criteria listed in subdivision (g).

- Historic resources and historic districts designated or listed as city or county landmarks or historic properties or districts pursuant to any city or county ordinance, if the criteria for designation or listing under the ordinance have been determined by the office to be consistent with California Register criteria.

- Local landmarks or historic properties designated under any municipal or county ordinance.\(^\text{13}\)

**Local Designation Programs**

The City of Pasadena has established an historic preservation program in order

\(^{12}\) California PRC, Section 5023.1(d).

\(^{13}\) California PRC, Section 5023.1(e).
to promote “the identification, evaluation, rehabilitation, adaptive use, and restoration of historic structures.” The criteria for the designation of historic monuments, landmarks, historic signs, landmark trees, or landmark districts are applied “according to applicable National Register of Historic Places Bulletins for evaluating historic properties.” These criteria are excerpted below from Section 17.62.40 of the Pasadena Zoning Code.¹⁴

**Historic Monuments**

A historic monument shall include all historic resources previously designated as historic treasures before adoption of [Zoning Code Chapter 17.62], historic resources that are listed in the National Register at the State-wide or Federal level of significance (including National Historic Landmarks) and any historic resource that is significant at a regional, State, or Federal level, and is an exemplary representation of a particular type of historic resource and meets one or more of the following criteria:

a) It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the region, State, or nation.

b) It is associated with the lives of persons who are significant in the history of the region, State, or nation.

c) It is exceptional in the embodiment of the distinctive characteristics of a historic resource property type, period, architectural style, or method of construction, or that is an exceptional representation of the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose work is significant to the region, State, or nation, or that possesses high artistic values that are of regional, State-wide or national significance.

d) It has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history of the region, State, or nation.

A historic monument designation may include significant public or semi-public interior spaces and features.

**Landmarks**

A landmark shall include all properties previously designated a landmark before adoption of [Zoning code Chapter 17.62] and any historic resource that is of a local level of significance and meets one or more of the criteria listed below.

A landmark may be the best representation in the City of a type of

¹⁴ City of Pasadena Online Zoning Code Title 17. http://ww2.cityofpasadena.net/zoning/
historic resource or it may be one of several historic resources in the City that have common architectural attributes that represent a particular type of historic resource. A landmark shall meet one or more of the following criteria:

a) It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the City, region, or State.

b) It is associated with the lives of persons who are significant in the history of the City, region, or State.

c) It embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, architectural style, period, or method of construction, or represents the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose work is of significance to the City or, to the region or possesses artistic values of significance to the City or to the region.

d) It has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important locally in prehistory or history.

**Historic Signs**

A historic sign shall include all signs in the sign inventory as of the date of adoption of the Zoning Code and any sign subsequently designated historically significant by the Historic Preservation Commission that possesses high artistic values. A historic sign shall meet one or more of the following criteria:

a) The sign is exemplary of technology, craftsmanship or design of the period when it was constructed, uses historic sign materials and means of illumination, and is not significantly altered from its historic period. Historic sign materials shall include metal or wood facings, or paint directly on the façade of a building. Historic means of illumination shall include incandescent light fixtures or neon tubing on the exterior of the sign. If the sign has been altered, it must be restorable to its historic function and appearance.

b) The sign is integrated with the architecture of the building.

c) A sign not meeting criteria a or b above may be considered for inclusion in the inventory if it demonstrates extraordinary aesthetic quality, creativity, or innovation.

All other regulations relating to signs shall comply with Chapter 17.48 (Signs).

**Landmark Trees**

A tree shall qualify to be of historic or cultural significance and of importance to the community if it meets any one of the following criteria:

1. It is one of the largest or oldest trees of the species located in the City;

2. It has historical significance due to an association with a historic event, person, site, street, or structure; or
3. It is a defining landmark or significant outstanding feature of a neighborhood.

**Landmark Districts**

A landmark district shall include all landmark districts previously designated before adoption of this Chapter and any grouping of contiguous properties that also meet the following criteria:

a) Within its boundaries, a minimum of 60 percent of the properties qualify as contributing; and

b) The grouping represents a significant and distinguishable entity of Citywide importance and one or more of a defined historic, cultural, development and/or architectural context(s) (e.g., 1991 Citywide historic context, as amended, historic context prepared in an intensive-level survey or historic context prepared specifically for the nominated landmark district).

When considering applications to designate a landmark district, the Historic Preservation Commission shall use the National Register of Historic Places Bulletin #21: “Defining Boundaries for National Register Properties”.

**4.3 Central District Specific Plan**

Development in central Pasadena is governed by the Central District Specific Plan which contains detailed development standards, distribution of land uses, infrastructure requirements, and implementation measures. Area Specific Plans are designed to implement the goals and policies of the City’s General Plan.

The Central District Specific Plan divides the area into several sub-districts. The Project Site is located within the Civic Center/Midtown Sub-district. The objective of the Civic Center/Midtown Sub-district is to strengthen its role as the symbolic and governmental center of the City, encouraging the presence of civic, cultural and public service institutions, while augmenting the character of the area with a supportive mixture of uses.15

**4.4 Historic Significance and Integrity**

**Significance**

The definition of historic significance used by the California Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) in its administration of the California Register is based upon the definition used by the National Park Service for the National Register:

*Historic significance is defined as the importance of a property to the history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, or culture of a community, state, or the nation.*16 It is achieved in several ways:

---

15 Central District Specific Plan, Section 7.
• Association with important events, activities or patterns

• Association with important persons

• Distinctive physical characteristics of design, construction, or form

• Potential to yield important information

A property may be significant individually or as part of a grouping of properties.

Historic Integrity

Historic integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance and is defined as the “authenticity of a property’s historic identity, evidenced by the survival of physical characteristics that existed during the property’s historic period.”\textsuperscript{17} The National Park Service defines seven aspects of integrity: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. These qualities are defined as follows:

• Location is the place where the historic property was constructed or the place where the historic event took place.

• Design is the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a property.

• Setting is the physical environment of a historic property.

• Materials are the physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration to form a historic property.

• Workmanship is the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory.

• Feeling is a property’s expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time.

• Association is the direct link between an important historic event or person and a historic property.\textsuperscript{18}

\textsuperscript{17} Ibid., p. 3.

5.0 IDENTIFICATION OF POTENTIAL HISTORICAL RESOURCES

Resources located both within and immediately outside the Project Site are examined in the following analysis for the purposes of identifying potential historical resources. The context of their previous evaluations, criteria for significance and integrity issues are explored.

The Project Site is within the boundary of the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District, and the Pasadena YWCA, which is located on the Project Site, is listed in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributing building to the District. The Pasadena YWCA is also listed in the California Register of Historical Resources and designated as a historic monument by the City of Pasadena, a designation that denotes regional significance and includes public and semi-public interior spaces. The Pasadena Civic Center Historic District, and its contributors, which, in addition to the Pasadena YWCA, include Pasadena City Hall, are described in Section 5.2 below. Additionally, the Civic Center Financial Historic District is located immediately south of the Pasadena YWCA along the east side of Marengo Avenue and is described in Section 5.3 below.

5.1 Pasadena YWCA

The Pasadena YWCA is located at 78 North Marengo Avenue in the City of Pasadena, bound by Holly Street to the north and Union Street to the south; Marengo Avenue to the west and Garfield Avenue to the east.

Completed in phases in 1922 and 1923, and designed by architect Julia Morgan, the Pasadena YWCA is a designated historic property at the national, state, and local level. It was listed in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributor to the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District in 1980. In 1998, when the California Register of Historical Resources was enacted, all buildings listed in the National Register automatically became listed in the California Register. In 1998, it was designated an Historic Treasure, the highest level of local landmark designation, by the City of Pasadena. Subsequently, the Zoning Code was modified to replace the term “historic treasure” with the term “historic monument.”

Development History

The development of the Pasadena YWCA has its roots in the early twentieth century through the efforts of prominent local women who strived to address the needs and interests of young working women arriving in...
Pasadena during a time of social shifts and economic growth. The Young Women’s League was established in 1905 with the motto, “Not what we give, but what we share.” On April 15, 1909, the Young Women’s League became the Pasadena YWCA, and in 1910 they moved to an 1892 residence at 78 North Marengo Avenue. For the next ten years they operated out of this building.

In 1919, the Pasadena YWCA acquired the two lots to the south of their existing building on Marengo Avenue through a gift from David and Mary Gamble. The Pasadena Star News noted that although it was not yet time to build, “there is already the vision of a group of buildings that shall adequately house the various activities of the young women.”

Preliminary sketches by architect Julia Morgan were made public in November 1920, and by 1921 the properties were cleared for construction by moving the old headquarters building north and across the street for continued use during construction of new facility. The new complex was built in two phases as funds and land were available. Construction began in November of 1921 on the administrative unit which housed the common rooms, dormitories, and administrative offices. The main building was completed in October of 1922 to great praise from the Pasadena Star News, which devoted a full page to its opening. During construction of the main building, plans prepared by Julia Morgan for the gymnasium and swimming pool wing were published in June of 1922, and construction began in July and was completed in early 1923. It appears a third wing was planned along Union Street, completing a symmetrical U-shaped plan; however, this wing was never built.

The Pasadena YWCA building was designed with two primary street facades, Marengo Avenue and Union Street. The north side of the building, however, originally did not have a street flanking it until Holly Street was extended. This explains the relative lack of articulation on the north wing. The modest appearance of the gymnasium and swimming pool wing appears to be that it was constructed at the rear of the property which did not originally have street frontage until the Civic Center plan was developed which added the wide sidewalks and landscaping.

In 1927 several minor alterations were made to the building under the direction of architect F.C. Marsh. The roof deck on the east end of the south

——

wing on Union Street was enclosed for additional restrooms and dressing rooms. In the late 1930s, when it is documented that Julia Morgan oversaw some alterations,\textsuperscript{21} it appears the third floor porches were enclosed (or screened) at this time according to historic photographs.

Beginning in 1951, the most evident alterations to date were designed by Pasadena architect Rose Connor, AIA. Connor had worked in the offices of Reginald Johnson and Allison & Allison, and established her own office in 1936. She designed many residences throughout Southern California and a fair number of institutional projects as a consultant to larger firms; in the latter capacity she was the Associate Architect for the Fuller Theological Seminary campus in Pasadena.

These alterations were typical of the era, and were not designed with the existing architectural values of the building (then thirty years old) in mind, and as a result they contrast with the rest of the building and most are not difficult to identify. Most notably, the modifications included replacing the windows that enclosed the open porches along the east and west sides of the third floor with metal-framed fixed and jalousie windows, and the removal of the original divided-light wood-framed doors and wood-sash sidelights within the porches. The arched wood-sash fan-light transom glazing on primary façade was replaced with a simpler design. Also included were the removal of interior partitions, doors and built-in casework, and the addition of a sun room (later enclosed in 1972) on the south end of the primary facade.

In 1980, the Pasadena YWCA became a contributing building to the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District placing the building in the National Register of Historic Places.

Beginning in 1984, the Pasadena YWCA and YMCA proposed creating a joint facility which would have demolished the gymnasium and swimming pool wing. This plan was opposed by the City’s Cultural Heritage Commission and plans were abandoned in 1988.

In 1996, citing lack of funding to upkeep the building, the Pasadena YWCA moved out of the building into leased space. The building was then sold to a developer who ultimately was unable to rehabilitate the building. The City, afraid that years of lack of maintenance would result in demolition by neglect, acquired the property in 2012 through a negotiated settlement.

\textsuperscript{21} YWCA Centennial Booklet mentions that Julia Morgan approved plans for renovations in 1938, but the details were not documented.
for the purpose of rehabilitating the building to return it to active use.

**Julia Morgan**

Julia Morgan was among the most significant architects of her time and a trailblazer for women in the profession. Morgan was active with women’s associations across the western United States. Her career spanned close to half a century and she produced designs for over 800 structures. She is perhaps best known for her design of the William Randolph Hearst Estate at San Simeon.

Julia Morgan was born in San Francisco on January 20, 1872. She was one of the first women to graduate from the University of California, Berkeley with a degree in Civil Engineering (the university did not yet offer a degree in architecture). During her tenure at Berkeley she studied under Bernard Maybeck. With Maybeck’s encouragement she left for Paris in 1896 to seek enrollment in the prestigious École des Beaux Arts. Morgan holds the distinction of being the first woman to enter the Department of Architecture, and in 1902 she became the first woman to receive the Certificate in architecture. Her Paris training also positioned her among the elite of California architects in the early twentieth century.

Upon her return to California, Morgan worked briefly for John Galen Howard, University Architect at Berkeley, aiding Howard with two specific projects at the University, the Hearst Memorial Mining Building and the Greek Amphitheater. Morgan left Howard’s employment and opened her own San Francisco office in 1904. After the disastrous earthquake and fire of 1906, Morgan reorganized her office, which had burned, and joined the efforts of the many architects needed to rebuild the city. During this period Morgan worked on numerous residential projects and several churches and schools.

Morgan’s involvement with the YWCA began in 1913 with the Oakland and San Jose YWCA centers and the seaside conference center at Asilomar near Monterey. Morgan’s work for the YWCA was a solid source of income during her career. Between 1913 and 1930, Morgan designed at least twenty-three commissions for various chapters of the YWCA, primarily in California and Hawaii.

**Description**

The Pasadena YWCA is a two-story building with a partial third story located on the block of Marengo Avenue between Holly Street and Union Street. The building was designed...
in a Mediterranean style by San Francisco architect Julia Morgan.

The Pasadena YWCA is a single building with a partial U-shaped plan with the west (primary) facade facing on Marengo Avenue. The building is set within the Pasadena Civic Center; its location mirrors the YMCA on the north side of Holly Street, with both buildings flanking the Holly Street axis that terminates at the monumental facade of Pasadena City Hall.

There is a courtyard within the open portion of the “U” which is oriented to the east. The north and south wings make up the side street facades on Holly (with a forty-five-foot landscaped setback from the Holly Street sidewalk) and Union Streets (which abuts the sidewalk). The north wing along Holly Street is longer than the Union Street wing and has single-story, double-height volumes, which contain the gymnasium and the swimming pool. The south wing terminates at a surface parking lot.

The exterior of the building is clad in a smooth cement plaster finish, and the multiple, low-pitched gabled roofs are clad in clay barrel tile. The overhanging open eaves have exposed wood details, including rafter ends, purlins, and applied trim. The east end of the north wing has a flat roof with a parapet and a long metal-frame skylight over the swimming pool area.

The west (primary) facade is made up of three volumes; the center volume is three stories with a side-gable roof, and the symmetrical flanking volumes are two stories with front-facing gables. The windows and arched doors are wood frame with divided-light wood sash glazing. There is an iron balcony attached at the second floor with decorative railing and decorative scrolled brackets, and decorative iron rosettes covering the attic vents.

Alterations to west facade include enclosing the open porches at the third floor with metal-framed glazing, and the 1951 one-story addition with a flat roof at the first floor of the south volume.

The secondary facades materially resemble the primary facade and typically have wood-framed divided-light casement windows with wood sash glazing and wood-framed transom windows. The gymnasium and swimming pool wing consists of two volumes; the gymnasium has a gable roof with cement plaster walls and wood-sash divided-light vertical tripartite windows with a buttress between each window bay; the swimming pool wing is clad in cement plaster and has a flat roof with a skylight that spans the length of the roof and a stepped parapet at the east end. There are narrow terra cotta vents on the north facade and wood-sash divided-light paired windows on the south facade.

The interior plan consists of public gathering spaces on the ground floor.
and circulation, dormitories, and lounges on the upper floors. The walls are smooth painted plaster with wood trim and molding, and the floors are typically scored concrete.

The main entrance opens onto a large lobby with offices at the four corners. The floors in the main public spaces are brick pavers in a basket-weave pattern. Two poured concrete staircases, one at each end of the east wall of the lobby, lead to the second floor. The main axis of circulation on each floor runs north to south, crossing the entry axis. The axis through the lobby has large gathering rooms at either end. At the north end is a large room with a fireplace and an elevated stage within a segmental-arched proscenium. The gymnasium and the swimming pool, with parallel shower room and classrooms, are situated east of this space and terminate the longer north wing. Each have two-story volumes and open wood truss ceilings.

At the south end of the lobby axis, occupying most of the south wing, is a large room that was historically the cafeteria and kitchen. This space is now subdivided and partially altered.

The upper floors have double-loaded corridors with dormitory rooms anchored by lounges, meeting rooms, and small kitchens.

Character-Defining Features

Exterior

- U-shaped plan with varied massing and gabled roofs
- Cement plaster cladding and mission barrel roof tiles
- Open eaves with exposed rafters
- Symmetrical primary façade with two- and three-story volumes
- Decorative iron balcony
- Decorative iron rosettes covering attic vents
- Wood-framed divided-light doors with transoms; arched and squared
- Wood-framed divided-light windows with transoms
- Gymnasium and swimming pool wing with steel sash divided-light windows, and ceramic tile vents

---

Pasadena YWCA Historic Resources Technical Report
October 2015

HISTORIC RESOURCES GROUP

---

23 A complete list of character-defining features can be found in the “DRAFT Pasadena YWCA Rehabilitation Study” prepared by Architectural Resources Group, February 18, 2011.
Interior

- Main lobby and public gathering spaces with brick pavers in basket-weave pattern
- Proscenium and stage
- Fireplaces with wood and tile mantels
- Built-in paneled casework
- Arched concrete ceiling beams with brackets
- Doubled-loaded circulation corridors
- Plaster walls with wood baseboards and trim
- Scored concrete floors
- Poured concrete stairwells with iron handrails and wood caps
- Remnant painted, stenciled decoration on stairwell walls
- Wood-framed doorways with transom lights
- Wood paneled doors
- Gymnasium wood plank floor and exposed wood truss ceiling
- Swimming pool and exposed wood truss ceiling

Significance

The Pasadena YWCA is significant as a work of master architect Julia Morgan. Mediterranean in style, the building exemplifies both Morgan’s work with the YWCA and the historical mission of that organization. The gymnasium and swimming pool wing were part of the second phase of construction; however, they are contributing features of the complex due to their significance as essential activities and offerings of the YWCA and design by Julia Morgan.

Two areas of significance for the YWCA should be considered: one for significance associated with a historic pattern of events in the area of significance of social history (National Register Criterion A; corresponds to California Register Criterion 1) and one for historic significance as a building type in the area of architecture (National Register Criterion C; corresponds to California Register Criterion 3). At the local level, the building also qualifies under Criterion C as the work of a master architect Julia Morgan. While more significant examples of her work exist, there are no other examples in Pasadena.

While the Pasadena YWCA has had deferred maintenance and has been altered to some extent on both the exterior and interior, the building still retains a high level of historic integrity.

The Pasadena YWCA is formally listed in the National Register as a contributor to a historic district, and is listed in the California Register. Because it is listed in the National and California Registers,
the Pasadena YWCA is considered an historical resource under CEQA.

5.2 Pasadena Civic Center National Register Historic District

The Pasadena Civic Center Historic District (the “District”) is significant as the historic government and institutional center of Pasadena, and is a significant example of American city planning and civic architecture. The District also contains an important record of the evolution of architectural design in southern California as well as the work of many prominent regional architects.

The District boundaries are irregular and incorporate Garfield Avenue from the Civic Auditorium to the south and the Public Library to the north, as the main north-south axis; and Holly Street from Raymond Avenue to the west to City Hall and the east side of Euclid Avenue on the east, as the main east-west axis. The District contains fifteen contributing resources, which form the historic Civic Center of the City of Pasadena.

The ideas behind Pasadena’s Civic Center emerged from the City Beautiful movement. Led by the architect Daniel H. Burnham of Chicago, proponents of the movement supported Beaux-Arts style architecture and planning principles as a way to bring beauty, dignity, and civic order to American cities. Pasadena residents were exposed to these ideas through speakers who came through town to present to the many active private clubs of Pasadena. A City Beautiful Association was formed locally in 1914 to promote beautification and coordinated planning efforts.

City Beautiful Movement

This City Beautiful movement was a response to the crowded, chaotic, dirty, and dangerous cities of the early industrial age that arose in the late 1800s and early 1900s. The movement was conceived as explicitly progressive and reform-minded. City Beautiful leaders believed the emphasis should be on creating a beautiful city, which would in turn inspire its inhabitants to moral and civic virtue.

Generally stated, the City Beautiful advocates sought to improve their city through beautification, which would have a number of effects: 1) social ills would be swept away, as the beauty of the city would inspire civic loyalty and moral rectitude in the impoverished; 2) American cities would be brought to cultural parity with their European competitors through the use of the European Beaux-Arts idiom; and 3) a

---

more inviting city center still would not bring the upper classes back to live, but certainly to work and spend money in the urban areas.25

By building dramatic structures as symbols of municipal order, architects and planners sought to restore a sense of grandeur and stability to cities. Such symbols included large buildings, wide boulevards, parks, gardens, and central government centers.

The first expression of the City Beautiful movement occurred in Chicago at the World's Columbian Exposition of 1893. The fair was a tour de force of early city planning and architectural cohesion as set forth by Director of Construction and architect Daniel H. Burnham. Architects were instructed by Burnham to design in the Beaux-Arts style so as to create monumental and vaguely classical buildings, all of uniform cornice height, and all decorated roughly the same. The Beaux-Arts style was considered dignified and beautiful, and Americans embraced the style. The fair also introduced the concept of a monumental core or civic center, an arrangement of buildings intended to inspire in their beauty and harmony, as well as the beginnings of comprehensive city planning.

The first organized expression of the City Beautiful movement as a means of beautification and social control was the 1901 plan for Washington D.C., designed by Daniel H. Burnham. It was also the United States’ first attempt at city planning. Its success was felt nationwide as other cities quickly put forth city beautification plans of their own.

In California, San Francisco, Pasadena, as well as Los Angeles generated city plans directly based on the City Beautiful movement. Pasadena began discussions as early as 1902, but it wasn’t until 1922 that the firm of Bennett, Parsons & Frost was hired to devise a Civic Center plan. In a unique turn, Pasadena specifically requested architects to submit designs with Mediterranean influenced styles, although formality and uniformity were still the guiding principles. The result was a complex of government, institutional and cultural buildings that epitomized, although on a small scale, the City Beautiful movement.

**Bennett Plan**

In April of 1922 Pasadena established a planning commission, which determined that the City needed a new city hall and public library, as well as a new civic auditorium, and art museum.

---

Shortly thereafter, the planning commission engaged Burnham’s Chicago successor firm, Bennett, Parsons & Frost, to study the planning needs of Pasadena and to create what came to be known as the Bennett Plan. The Civic Center was the central component of the plan and incorporated several existing buildings, including the United States Post Office (1914), YMCA (1910/1925) and YWCA (1922).

In January 1923, the firm prepared concept plans for the City identifying locations for City Hall, the Public Library, and the Civic Auditorium. The plan showed suggested footprints for the proposed civic buildings, street extensions, and landscaped areas. Of particular note for this report are the L-shaped landscaped areas that flank Holly Street and wrap to the west side of Garfield Avenue, which show up very clearly on the plan. As this was an early concept plan, not all of the ideas were adopted; however, this early plan bears a striking resemblance to what was eventually built and exists today. See Figure C-5 in Appendix C.

The voters approved the funding for, and the idea of, a City Plan in June 1923, and, subsequent to the vote, Bennett, Parsons & Frost were officially selected as consultants and designers to implement the plan. The City Plan approved by the voters was defined as the acquisition of specific tracts of land for construction of a City Hall, Public Library and Civic Auditorium along with grounds and approaches. The design of the buildings, grounds and approaches was not specified in the ballot language, nor was the 1923 map prepared by Bennett, Parsons & Frost, attached as Figure C-5 in Appendix C referenced in the ballot measure language or in actions by the Planning Commission or City Council leading up to the vote. In April 1925, the firm published “A Report on a Plan for the City of Pasadena,” a narrative report discussing the character of Pasadena as it then existed, and recommendations on four topics: 1) street layout and design, 2) public buildings, 3) parks and open space, and 4) transit. A drawing not included in this narrative document, but produced about the same time is a more detailed and refined plan of the Civic Center from 1925 (with revisions noted through 1926), which more closely resembles existing conditions. The L-shaped landscaped areas are still present, but the east ends along Garfield Avenue have been reduced, and what we now know as open park-like areas adjacent to the YMCA and YWCA were reserved as “Automobile Space (Future Building Site).” See Figure C-6 in Appendix C. Subsequently, these parcels were never built upon and have remained open park-like areas from the time they were reconfigured for the Civic Center plan in 1925.

At the time the plan for the Civic Center was developed, Pasadena
Enjoyed the highest per capita income of any city of its size in the United States. This economic fact explains the ambitious nature of the plan, including the creation of new streets, the rerouting of old ones to put buildings at the end of formal axes, the plaza at the front of the City Hall, and the profusion of ornamentation on the buildings. Other small cities simply did not have the resources to plan, as well as execute, such an ambitious plan, which made Pasadena’s effort unique.

Pasadena’s Civic Center was designed to be distinct from its surrounding neighborhoods both in architectural style and feeling. The district is far less commercial and more park-like. Planned with the pedestrian in mind, the streets are wider, lined with trees and shrubs. The sidewalks also are wider and paved in tile and brick set in decorative patterns. Two L-shaped landscaped areas were designed to line Holly Street from Marengo Avenue to Garfield Avenue and wrap one block to the north and south onto the west sides of Garfield Avenue. As noted above, based on the drawing “Pasadena Civic Building Group General Plan,” by Bennett, Parsons & Frost, March 1925/April 1926, these L-shaped parkways were indicated as “Automobile Space (Future Building Site).” These areas were never developed; however, and have remained as undeveloped landscaped areas since implementation of the Bennett Plan. The configuration of streets, sidewalks, parkways and landscaped areas within the Civic Center District embody key tenets of the City Beautiful Movement and define important spatial relationships between the buildings in the district.

City Hall was planned as the eastern terminus located at the end of Holly Street, which was extended eastward from the earlier commercial center of town (now Old Pasadena). City Hall was set off with a vast plaza that served as the cross axis of the Holly Street corridor and the Garfield Avenue corridor. The Garfield corridor was planned with the Pasadena Public Library at its head in the north, and with the Civic Auditorium planned for a site south of Colorado Boulevard at Green Street. Street extensions were part of a larger plan for improved circulation, especially with the growing dominance of automobile traffic. They allowed for easier paths of travel around the city, which was growing significantly in area during the 1920s and 1930s through development and annexation. Locating the main buildings as terminations of axes showed them off to their best advantage, which gave a sense of interest, scale and unity to the center of the City.

Significant local and regional architects contributed to the success of the Civic Center, including Bakewell and Brown of San Francisco (City Hall), Myron Hunt and H. C. Chambers (Pasadena...
Public Library), Julia Morgan (the pre-Civic Center YWCA), Bennett and Haskell (Pasadena Civic Auditorium), and Marston and Van Pelt (redesign of the YMCA).

Since the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District was originally listed in 1980, some of the contributing buildings have been rehabilitated in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. None of the contributing buildings have been demolished, and several new noncontributing buildings have been constructed. The new construction occurred on vacant and surface parking lots, and is generally compatible with the historic architecture of the District. Overall, the District retains a high-level of integrity and continues to convey its historic significance.

The District is formally listed in the National Register and is listed in the California Register. Because it is listed in the National and California Registers, the District is considered a historical resource under CEQA.

A map of the District showing the boundaries, contributors, and the Project Site is shown in Figure 3. Site and building photographs are included in Appendix A and B.
Figure 3: Pasadena Civic Center Historic District
There are several contributing resources, in addition to the Pasadena YWCA, to the District in the immediate vicinity of the Project Site. These include:

A. **281 Colorado Boulevard**  
**[U.S. Post Office]**

The United States Post Office is located across Union Street just south of the Project Site. Built in 1915 and designed by architect Oscar Wenderoth, noted for his many government buildings, the primary (south) façade faces Colorado Boulevard and predates the Civic Center and Bennett Plan. The northern addition, which has frontage on Union Street directly south of the project site, was designed by Sylvanus B. Marston and was completed in 1939. The current building spans the west side of Garfield Avenue from Union Street to Colorado Boulevard.

This monumental one- and two-story government building is Italian Renaissance Revival in style with Mediterranean massing and symmetry. Clad with smooth cement plaster and clay tiled hipped roofs, the Colorado Boulevard façade has an arched loggia with decorative pilasters and ironwork. The later addition is more restrained but is compatible in scale and mass.

C. **95 North Marengo Avenue**  
**[Turner & Stevens Company]**

This complex is located on the northwest corner of Marengo Avenue and Holly Street, across the intersection from the Project Site. Built in 1922 as the Turner and Stevens Mortuary and designed in the English Gothic style by architects Marston and Van Pelt, the two-story brick complex with an open arcade and inner courtyard has multiple steep pitched gabled roofs and a spire atop the small central chapel. The complex is no longer a mortuary and has had rotating commercial uses in recent years, but has retained a high degree of historic integrity with few alterations.

D. **125-137 North Marengo Avenue**  
**[American Legion]**

This two-story Mediterranean storefront which houses the American Legion Post 13 is located on the west side of Marengo Avenue, one parcel north of Holly Street and northwest across the intersection of the Marengo Avenue and Holly Street from the Project Site.

Constructed in 1925 and designed by the architectural firm Marston, Van Pelt and Maybury, the American Legion building has a symmetrical east façade with a central large-scaled arched opening and rusticated cast stone detailing, flanked by two storefronts on either side. The center portion of the second floor is set back to create an open deck between the end pavilions. The building has a flat roof with a shallow clay tile mansard roof along the primary facade. The storefronts on the first floor have been replaced but the building retains a high degree of historic integrity.
E. 75 North Marengo Avenue  
(First Baptist Church)
Constructed in 1925-26, this Romanesque church, located at the northeast corner of Holly Street and Marengo Avenue, was designed by architect Carlton M. Winslow. It is located just west of the Project Site across Marengo Avenue. The church and parish hall are clad with cement plaster and the varied hipped and gabled roofs have Spanish tiles. The dominant tower is derived from St. Trophine Cathedral in Arles, France. The church anchors the block across the street from the Project Site and has a high degree of architectural integrity.

F. 235 East Holly Street  
(Pasadena YMCA)
The Pasadena YMCA building is located north of the Project Site across Holly Street. Originally a YMCA the building, it is now Centennial Place, a single-room-occupancy residential complex.

The first YMCA building on this parcel was constructed in 1910 and designed by Arthur Benton. The building was enlarged and remodeled in 1926 by architects Marston and Van Pelt to be a compatible addition to the Civic Center. The four-story Mediterranean style building faces Holly Street and has rusticated quoins at the corners of the first story and a row of arched windows with decorative engaged columns at the fourth floor. The building is topped with a clay tile hipped roof. A two-story addition to the east, also by Marston and Van Pelt, housed a swimming pool, gymnasium and handball court. It has since been demolished.

H. 100 North Garfield Avenue  
(Pasadena City Hall)
Pasadena City Hall is located east of the Project Site across Garfield Avenue. Built in 1927 and designed by the San Francisco firm of Bakewell and Brown, it is the dominant building of the Civic Center. It occupies an entire city block, bound by Garfield Avenue and a central plaza on the west, Ramona Street on the north, Euclid Avenue on the east and Union Street on the south.

City Hall is a rectangular building outlining a spacious central court. The east side is a one-story arcade. The other three sides are three stories high with small towers at each corner and the main dome over the west entrance. The main dome structure rises six stories, and reaches 206 feet above the ground at its highest point. The oversized lantern atop the dome is a viewing gallery. The roofs are clad with red Cordova clay tile and the dome is covered with fish-scale red clay tile. The lanterns of the stair towers and the main dome are sheathed in copper. The walls are clad with smooth cement plaster and wall ornament is cast stone. Terracotta tiles are laid on the floors of the main lobby and corridors.
Pasadena YWCA
Historic Resources Technical Report
October 2015
HISTORIC RESOURCES GROUP

Bakewell and Brown had a Palladian purity of taste but approached the style freely when designing Pasadena City Hall, gracing the walls with a moderate amount of ornamentation in the form of lion heads and garlands, symbolizing strength and abundance, as well as scrolls bearing the official crown and key. The courtyard has a strong Spanish Colonial atmosphere. The focal point is the cast stone Baroque fountain.

A major seismic retrofit and rehabilitation in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards was completed in 2007. Pasadena City Hall maintains a high degree of historic integrity.

5.3 Pasadena Civic Center Financial National Register Historic District

The Civic Center Financial District consists of five architecturally significant buildings constructed between 1905 and 1928, grouped at the intersection of Colorado Boulevard and Marengo Avenue. It includes two high-rise buildings, at the southeast and northeast corners of the intersection and three two-story buildings immediately north on the east side of Marengo Avenue. The Financial District does not extend to Union Street or Garfield Avenue, making it physically separate from the Civic Center District.

Growth in this area was stimulated by the development of the Civic Center in the early twentieth century. The physical improvements of the Civic Center attracted financial institutions who might benefit from a close association with the gravitas and dignity implied by the Civic Center design. The commitment to upholding a stable image for the banking center is evidenced in the Civic Center Financial District by the use of classical architectural vocabulary to lend substance, prestige, and a link to the Civic Center institutions. The work of several noted Los Angeles and Pasadena architects is displayed in the District and each individual structure exhibits a high quality of architectural design.

The Pacific Southwest Building (1924) designed by Curlett and Beelman is an eight-story Renaissance Revival style bank and office building at the southeast corner of Colorado Boulevard and Marengo Avenue. The Citizens Savings Building (1914) designed by John Parkinson and Edwin Bergstrom is a seven-story Neo-Classical bank and office structure at the northeast corner of Colorado Boulevard and Marengo Avenue. These two structures are situated at the crest of a rise and have visually commanded this site for close to a century.

Additionally, the three commercial buildings extending along North Marengo are similar to their larger counterparts in materials and Beaux Arts features. These buildings continue the classical formality of the Civic Center Financial District at a smaller scale, forming an important adjunct to the two monumental bank buildings.

From an urban design perspective, the Civic Center Financial District provides a meaningful transition between the public institutions of the Civic Center and the commercial development of Pasadena’s traditional downtown (Old Pasadena). Contributing buildings to the Civic Center Financial District retain a high level of integrity and continue to convey their historic significance and important associations. The Civic Center Financial District is listed in the National Register and is listed in the California Register. Because it is listed in the National and California Registers, the Civic Center Financial District is considered a historical resource under CEQA.

A map of the Civic Center Financial District is shown in Figure 4. Site and building photographs are included in Appendix A and B.
Figure 4: Civic Center Financial Historic District
5.4 Other Potential Cultural Resources

Pasadena Robinson Memorial: Jackie and Mack Robinson

The Robinson Memorial consists of two bronze sculptures, nine-foot tall busts of brothers Jackie and Mack Robinson, situated on the northeast corner of the Project Site at the southwest corner of Garfield Avenue and Holly Street.

The Robinson Memorial is the collaborative work of artists Ralph Helmick, John Outterbridge, and Stuart Schechter. Ralph Helmick is a Massachusetts-based sculptor who has created sculpture and site-specific artworks throughout the United States. Helmick often works in collaboration with Stuart Schechter, a Massachusetts artist who paints and draws in addition to sculpting. John Outterbridge is a Los Angeles-based artist who has exhibited work throughout the United States. All three artists are alive and working at the time of this report.

The sculptures were dedicated on November 6, 1997, which coincided with the 50th anniversary of Jackie Robinson joining the Brooklyn Dodgers. The landscaping was completed June 20, 2002 with a commemorative ring of granite tiles etched with donor’s names, lighting, inscribed benches, and landscaping, including flowering peach trees to honor the Robinson brothers’ birthplace of Cairo, Georgia.

The memorial commemorates the lives of baseball hero Jackie Robinson and his brother, Olympic champion Mack Robinson, in their hometown of Pasadena. A goal of the project was to evoke an appreciation of their contributions beyond the athletic sphere. The bust of Jackie Robinson looks toward the east, past City Hall, where he made his mark breaking the color barrier in professional baseball and became a successful businessman. The bust of Mack Robinson looks directly at the front doors of City Hall where he spent his life after the Olympics working directly for the city in many capacities.

The Robinson Memorial is not listed in the National Register, California Register or designated a local landmark. The Robinson Memorial has never been found eligible for listing as a historic resource through historic resources survey or environmental review.

Dedicated in 1997, the Robinson Memorial is a commemorative memorial that is currently 18 years old. Generally, a property would need to be substantially older in order to be eligible for designation as a historic resource. In addition, the Robinson Memorial is a commemorative object designed and installed to memorialize two local citizens who went on to national and international renown as athletes.
According to guidance provided by the National Park Service for applying National Register criteria, “…properties that have achieved significance within the past 50 years shall not be considered eligible for the National Register.” 27 National Register guidance also states that “a commemorative property generally must be over fifty years old and must possess significance based on its own value, not on the value of the event or person being memorialized.” 28 Criteria for the California Register does not state a specific age criteria but does state that “sufficient time must have passed to obtain a scholarly perspective on the events or individuals associated with the resource.” 29

Properties less than 50 years of age can be eligible for listing; however, if they meet special requirements, called Criteria Considerations. National Register Criteria Consideration G addresses resources constructed in the recent past, and states that a property may be listed in the National Register prior to reaching the 50-year threshold if it is of “exceptional importance.” For properties achieving significance within the past 50 years, the California Register contains a Special (Criteria) Consideration that states that “a resource less than 50 years old may be considered for listing in the California Register if it can be demonstrated that sufficient time has passed to understand its historical importance.” 30

As a commemorative art piece, the Robinson Memorial’s primary value is its association with the Robinson brothers, and sufficient time has not passed for the development of important associations beyond its commemorative value. Therefore, the Robinson Memorial does not possess associations with events or persons that would make it eligible for listing under National Register Criteria A or B, California Register Criterion 1 or 2, or Pasadena Landmark Criterion a or b.

Artists Ralph Helmick, John Outterbridge, and Stuart Schechter are all contemporary artists who continue to be active today. Sufficient time has not passed to fully understand the body of their work or their importance as artists. Therefore, the Robinson Memorial cannot be said to embody distinctive characteristics, represent the work of a master, or possess high artistic value that would make it eligible under National Register Criterion C, California Register Criterion 3, or Pasadena Landmark Criterion c. Having been dedicated less than twenty years ago, more time is required to gain the

---

28 Ibid.
29 California Office of Historic Preservation Technical Assistance Series #6, p. 3.
30 Ibid.
necessary perspective on its potential historic significance.

The Robinson Memorial is a commemorative public art piece and less than fifty years old, as such, it does not qualify as an historical resource under CEQA.

Sister Cities Trees

President Dwight D. Eisenhower founded the Sister Cities program in 1956 to achieve international peace through a people-to-people concept of twinning U.S. cities with foreign communities all over the globe. His hope was that through goodwill, understanding, and helping other cultures we would ensure a world of peace. Sister Cities is the largest citizen exchange organization in the world.

The Pasadena Sister Cities Committee is an official committee of the City of Pasadena. The volunteer members have set a pace for the future by globally linking Pasadena with lasting friendships with sister cities. This cross-cultural linking enriches each city with cultural, social, and economic benefits.

Five different trees were planted in recognition of the relationship between Pasadena and each of its five Sister Cities: Ludwigshafen, Germany; Mishima, Japan; Järvenpää, Finland; Vanadzor, Armenia; and Xicheng District, Beijing, China.31

Three plaques mark the small grove of trees across Garfield Avenue from City Hall, south of Holly Street. One plaque commemorates the sister-city relationship between Pasadena and Vanadzor, Armenia and marks a Freemont cottonwood tree planted in June 1997. Another plaque reads, “These trees dedicated to the International Friendship between Pasadena, Ludwigshafen, Mishima and Järvenpää. Pasadena Sister City Committee December 1988”, marking a Floss silk tree, a Red alder tree, and a Mugo pine tree. The final plaque commemorates the friendship between Pasadena and Xicheng District, Beijing, China and marks a Japanese pagoda tree planted in 1999.

The Sister Cities Trees make up a landscape of trees planted in commemoration of sister-city relationships between Pasadena and other international cities. The earliest tree was dedicated in 1988, making the oldest Sister City Tree 27 years old. As explained above with the Robinson Memorial, a property generally needs to be substantially older in order to be eligible for designation as a historic

---

resource and a commemorative property generally must be over fifty years old and must possess historic significance beyond the event or person being memorialized.” 32

The Sister City Tree’s significance is in their commemoration of world peace and sufficient time has not passed for the development of important associations beyond their commemorative value. The Sister City trees do not possess associations with events or persons that would make them eligible for listing under National Register Criteria A or B, California Register Criterion 1 or 2, or Pasadena Landmark Criterion a or b. Nor, as landscape design features, do they embody distinctive characteristics, represent the work of a master, or possess high artistic value that would make them eligible under National Register Criterion C, California Register Criterion 3, or Pasadena Landmark Criterion c. As such, they do not qualify as historical resources under CEQA.

6.0 POTENTIAL HISTORICAL IMPACTS

6.1 Framework for Analysis

The following analysis is informed by National, State and local guidelines.

Thresholds of Significance

According to Appendix G, Environmental Checklist of the State CEQA Guidelines, cultural resource impacts resulting from the implementation of the proposed project would be considered significant if a project would:

- Cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historical resource defined in CEQA Guidelines Section 15064.5.

CEQA Thresholds

The State CEQA Guidelines (2014) indicate that a project normally have a significant impact on historical resources if it would result in a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historical resource. A substantial adverse change in significance occurs if the project involves “physical demolition, destruction, relocation, or alteration of the resource or its immediate surroundings such that the significance of an historical resource would be materially impaired.”

The Guidelines go on to state that “[t]he significance of an historic resource is materially impaired when a project… [d]emolishes or materially alters in an adverse manner those physical characteristics of an historical resource that convey its historical significance and that justify its inclusion in, or eligibility for, inclusion in the California Register of Historical Resources… local register of historic resources… or its identification in a historic resources survey.”

Additional Guidance

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (the “Standards”) provide guidance for reviewing proposed projects that may affect historic resources.

The intent of the Standards is to assist the long-term preservation of a property’s significance through the preservation, rehabilitation, and maintenance of historic materials and features. The Standards pertain to historic buildings of all materials, construction types, sizes, and occupancy and encompass the exterior and interior of the buildings. The Standards also encompass related landscape features and the building’s site and environment.

33 CEQA Guidelines, section 15064.5(b).
34 CEQA Guidelines, section 15064.5(b)(2).
as well as attached, adjacent, or related new construction.

From a practical perspective, the Standards have guided agencies in carrying out their historic preservation responsibilities including State and local officials when reviewing projects that may impact historic resources. The Standards have also been adopted by state and local jurisdictions across the country including the City of Pasadena.

In addition, the Standards are a useful analytic tool for understanding and describing the potential impacts of substantial changes to historic resources. However, these Guidelines and Regulations are not part of the CEQA process. CEQA requires analysis of physical impacts to the environment, not a regulatory consistency analysis. As discussed in case law “an inconsistency between a project and other land use controls does not in itself mandate a finding of significance. (Lighthouse Field Beach Rescue v. City of Santa Cruz (2005) 131 Cal.App.4th 1170.) A significant effect must be correlated to change in the “existing physical conditions.” (CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.2.).

The only relationship of the Secretary of the Interior Standards to the CEQA process are discussed under CEQA Guidelines Section 15064.5(b)(3):

“Generally, a project that follows the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings or the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings” (1995), Weeks and Grimmer, shall be considered as mitigated to a level of less than a significant impact on the historical resource.”

The statutory language above references the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and Guidelines for four distinct historic “treatments,” including: (1) preservation; (2) rehabilitation; (3) restoration; and (4) reconstruction. The specific standards and guidelines associated with each of these possible treatments are provided on the National Park Service’s website regarding the treatment of historic resources.35

For analytical purposes, a threshold decision must be made regarding which “treatment” standards should be used to analyze a project’s potential effect on historic resources.

The use of the Secretary of the Interior’s “rehabilitation” standards (the Rehabilitation Standards) provide a more conservative impact analysis than the other treatment standards for this project and account for the fact that the

---

35 CEQA Guidelines, section 15064(b)(3).
36 http://www.nps.gov/hps/tps/standguide/
Pasadena YWCA will likely require some form of protection during construction activities and ongoing maintenance over the term of the construction.

Rehabilitation Standards

The National Park Service encourages maintaining the integrity of a district through the appropriate design of infill buildings at vacant sites or sites where new buildings replace non-contributing buildings. The Standards are intended as general guidance for work on any historic building. The Rehabilitation Standards expand the discussion to sites and neighborhoods.

As written in the Rehabilitation Standards, there is a distinction, but not a fundamental difference, between the concerns for additions to historic buildings and new construction, or “infill” adjacent to historic buildings on a property or within a district. As with most matters of design and planning, the differences are defined by the scale, site, setting, and project. For example, a similarly scaled new addition with a “hyphen” (recessed connecting passageway) would be compatible if the addition is set back from the existing building and uses similar materials and a simplified design that references, but does not copy, the historic building. This would enable the addition to be viewed as an individual building, while being compatible with its surroundings.

Following are quotations from the National Park Service guidance.

“…a modern addition should be readily distinguishable from the older work; however, the new work should be harmonious with the old in scale, proportion, materials, and color.”

“Plan the new addition in a manner that provides some differentiation in material, color, and detailing so that the new work does not appear to be part of the historic building. The character of the historic resource should be identifiable after the addition is constructed.”

National Park Service:
Preservation Briefs 14

In addition to the Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation, the National Park Service publishes a series of briefs that includes “Preservation Briefs 14, New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings: Preservation Concerns,” as revised and republished in 2010. Among the concepts

---


39 Ibid.
presented are a balance between differentiation and compatibility, and subordination of the new to the old.

Preservation Briefs 14 states:

1. There is no formula or prescription for designing a new addition that meets the Standards. A new addition to a historic building that meets the Standards can be any architectural style -- traditional, contemporary or a simplified version of the historic building. However, there must be a balance between differentiation and compatibility in order to maintain the historic character and the identity of the building being enlarged. New additions that too closely resemble the historic building or are in extreme contrast to it fall short of this balance. Inherent in all of the guidance is the concept that an addition needs to be subordinate to the historic building.

2. The intent of the Preservation Briefs is to provide guidance to owners, architects and developers on how to design a compatible new addition…. A new addition to a historic building should preserve the building’s historic character. To accomplish this and meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, a new addition should:

   Preserve significant historic materials, features and form;
   Be compatible; and
   Be differentiated from the historic building.

6.2 Impacts from Rehabilitation of the Pasadena YWCA

The proposed Project would rehabilitate and adaptively reuse the existing Pasadena YWCA for use as a hotel. As detailed in the Project description, the existing YWCA lobby, library, and cafeteria on the ground floor would be rehabilitated as the lobby, gathering room and restaurant of the hotel. The second and third floors of the existing YWCA building would be rehabilitated into thirteen guestrooms and suites, meeting rooms and support spaces.

The existing Pasadena YWCA gymnasium and swimming pool spaces would become hotel ballrooms. The roof level above the existing gymnasium and swimming pool complex would be structurally strengthened and converted into an outdoor, rooftop pool area. The existing basement would provide for kitchen storage, general storage, mechanical rooms and administrative function space.

Without mitigation, rehabilitation of the existing Pasadena YWCA building has the potential to alter or remove character-defining features that are important in conveying the historic significance of the property.
6.3 Impacts from New Construction
Adjacent to the Pasadena YWCA

The Project proposes new construction of a six-story hotel building located immediately adjacent to the Pasadena YWCA and connected solely by a bridge at the third floor of the new construction to the rooftop of the north wing of the YWCA building. The new building will be constructed on land currently occupied by a surface parking lot (opening on to Union Street) and a public landscape area that parallels Garfield Avenue.

New construction that is adjacent to or related to an existing historic resource is addressed in Standard 9 of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. Standard 9 states in part: “New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.” The new construction portion of the Project will alter the spatial relationships on the property by inserting a new building in an area historically characterized by a parking lot and open space. In order for this alteration to be considered a substantial adverse change, however, it must be shown that the integrity and/or significance of the YWCA would be materially impaired by the proposed adjacent new construction.

The Pasadena YWCA is U-shaped in plan and primarily two-stories in height with a third story on the west façade. A courtyard within the open portion of the “U” is oriented eastward. The north and south wings make up the side street frontage on Holly and Union Streets. The north wing along Holly Street is longer and contains the single-story, double-height volumes of the gymnasium and the swimming pool. The south wing terminates at a surface parking lot that will be removed and replaced by the new construction.

New construction will be confined to the south and east portions of the block and will be spatially separate and distinct from the existing YWCA building. The bridge connection to the rooftop of the swimming pool wing will be minimally invasive with minor material loss, and the new construction will not materially alter or demolish any portion of the YWCA building. The L-shaped new building will remove the surface parking lot located directly east of the YWCA building’s south wing and south of the gymnasium and swimming pool wing and effectively enclose the interior courtyard space from the south and east.

The surface parking lot has been characteristic of the immediate setting of the Pasadena YWCA for much of its history. The parking lot is located adjacent to the rear and side elevations of the YWCA. Evidence suggests that the parcels containing the parking lot were acquired somewhat later by the YWCA, although the exact date is
Regardless, the parking lot is a feature of the YWCA site that is not critical to understanding the building’s original use, architecture, configuration, siting, or contribution to the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District. Despite altering the original spatial setting by enclosing the interior space that was historically open to the east, the Project will maintain the interior grade-level courtyard, and the historic configuration and orientation of the YWCA building will remain intact and discernible.

The proposed new hotel building will occupy a smaller footprint than the Pasadena YWCA but will be substantially taller. The existing building is 44-feet 6-inches tall, and the proposed new building will be 60-feet tall at its highest point. The Project will block public sight lines to the south-facing façade of the YWCA’s north wing. Public views of the courtyard facing facades, however, are not critical to the perception of the YWCA’s original massing and configuration or its important architectural features.

Important street views of the primary YWCA facades from the west along Marengo Avenue, from the north along Holly Street, and from the south along Union Street will remain unimpeded and will not be obscured by the proposed Project. The full height of the new building will not be fully discernable when viewed looking northeast along the south façade of the YWCA building from Union Street as the building steps back at the fourth floor 32 feet two inches on the west façade, creating a rooftop patio, and 2 feet 8 inches at the fifth floor for guestroom balconies on the south façade. In addition, the sixth floor affects an implied half story with a false mansard roof along the south and east facades which effectively steps back the sixth floor. The incremental set-backs at the upper floors will reduce the perception of height above the fourth floor when viewed from Union Street.

The Project conforms to Standard 9 because maintaining the Project Site as parking and open space is not critical to understanding the historic significance of the Pasadena YWCA. Ultimately, the YWCA building will continue to convey its historic significance after Project construction and will not be materially impaired. The general configuration and orientation of the YWCA building will remain discernible after construction and the primary north-, west-, and south-facing facades will remain intact and unobstructed. The Project will also maintain the interior grade-level courtyard and provide a spatial buffer between the existing YWCA building and the new construction. For these reasons, the significance and integrity of the YWCA building will remain intact and the building will retain its eligibility.
for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as a contributor to the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District, and its status as a City of Pasadena historic monument.

6.4 Impacts from New Construction in the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District

The Project Site is located within the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District ("District"). New construction will be within the district boundaries and within the vicinity of several buildings that are district contributors. In addition to the YWCA, the closest district contributors are the U.S. Post Office building at the southwest corner of Garfield Avenue and Union Street, and Pasadena City Hall located east of the project site across Garfield Avenue.

The Project proposes new construction of a six-story hotel building on land currently occupied by a surface parking lot and a public landscape area that parallels Garfield Avenue. This action will alter spatial relationships within the District by removing a portion of public landscape area and inserting a new building in an area historically characterized by open space. The height and placement of the building also has the potential to block or alter views and sightlines within the District. These alterations have the potential to significantly impact the District in an adverse manner if the integrity and/or significance of the District would be materially impaired by the proposed new construction.

As detailed in Section 5.0 of this report, Pasadena’s Civic Center was planned and designed utilizing the principals of the City Beautiful movement which emphasized civic order through formal axial street patterns, monumental civic architecture in the European Beaux-Arts idiom, plazas, parks and tree-lined boulevards. City Beautiful ideals were most fully realized at the intersection of Holly Street and Garfield Avenue where Pasadena City Hall is set off by a wide semi-circular plaza at the eastern terminus of Holly Street.

Two L-shaped landscaped areas lining Holly Street from Marengo Avenue to Garfield Avenue and wrapping one block to the north and south onto Garfield Avenue frame the large open plaza fronting City Hall. The landscape areas located west of the Garfield Avenue sidewalks were identified as parking and future building sites in a 1925-1926 drawing by Bennett, Parsons & Frost, suggesting that these areas were not necessarily intended as parkland. In practical terms; however, these areas were never developed and have remained open landscape since the development of the Civic Center. As such, they remain important to the spatial organization of the District.

The new construction proposed by the Project will occupy a portion of the landscape area fronting Garfield Avenue between Holly and Union Streets. The Project will retain the corner section of the landscape area
containing the Robinson Memorial sculpture and plaza.

The existing condition of the landscape area to be altered consists of 3,650 square feet of wood chips on the sloped surface between the surface parking lot and concrete walkway, 1,490 square feet of concrete walkway, and 8,240 square feet of grass and trees between the concrete walkway and decorative brick sidewalk. The Project will remove the wood chips and concrete walkway and retain 35% (2,880 square feet) of the grass between the Garfield Avenue sidewalk and the new construction.

Construction of the new building will remove a portion of the landscape area between Holly and Union Streets and alter the symmetrical arrangement of landscape areas that mirror each other on both sides of Holly Street facing City Hall. The loss of symmetry will be most apparent when viewed from above, looking west and down from the rotunda observation area of City Hall. This effect will be much less discernable from street level on Garfield Avenue or Holly Street because the remaining landscape south of Holly Street will continue to generally read as landscape despite encroachment and the design

and massing of the existing buildings on the flanking blocks north and south of Holly Street are not symmetrical with each other.41

The height and placement of the new building will alter some sightlines within the District. Views looking east from Union Street towards City Hall will be altered. Union Street is a one-way westbound street, so motorists do not typically experience that view shed although pedestrian views will be affected. The new building will partially block existing views of the U.S. Post Office looking south from Garfield Avenue at the Holly Street intersection. Both City Hall and the U.S. Post Office building will continue to be viewable from most vantage points and the interruption of the existing views will not reduce the significance or integrity of City Hall, the U.S. Post Office building or the District.

6.5 Compatibility

The additional guidance provided by the National Park Service for reviewing proposed new construction that may affect an historic resource, as stated above, be it an addition to an existing building or an infill building within an historic district, strive for the same outcome: a balance between

41 The former YMCA building located on the north side of Holly Street is rectangular in plan, four stories tall and has a main entrance fronting Holly Street. The YWCA building has a U-shape plan, is two and three stories tall with a main entrance fronting Marengo Avenue.
compatibility and differentiation, and the retention of integrity.

Standard 9 in part states: “The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.”

The proposed new construction will be differentiated from adjacent historic resources. It will be a contemporary design with balanced symmetrical proportions and will recall historic features that complement the Mediterranean Revival architecture of the Pasadena YWCA, City Hall, the U.S. Post Office, and other contributing buildings to the District.

The Project is compatible with the adjacent historic resources and the historic character of the District in terms of materials, features, and proportion. The new building is rectangular in plan and has massing similar and complimentary to the existing adjacent YWCA building. It also recalls traditional historic architectural design details found within the District including symmetrical arrangement, similarly proportioned fenestration, punched windows, cement plaster finishes, and tiled roof.

At six stories (60 feet), the proposed new building will be taller than most of the contributing buildings which range between two and five stories high. However, it will not be taller than the bulk of City Hall, which is 64 feet 6 inches. This contrast in scale, however, is in keeping with the existing condition of the Civic Center area which includes non-contributing buildings up to nine stories in height.

The Project conforms to Standard 9 because it will be differentiated from the historic resources adjacent to the site and will be compatible with the size, scale, proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the site and its surroundings.

Standard 10 states: “New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.”

The Project will not be an addition to the historic YWCA building but it will construct a new building immediately adjacent. The two buildings will be connected by a narrow bridge from the third floor terrace of the new building to the rooftop of the north wing of the existing building, with minimal material alteration to the YWCA building. As

---

42 http://www.nps.gov/hps/tps/standguide/rehab/rehab_standards.htm

43 Ibid.
such, if the new construction is removed in the future, the form and integrity of the historic YWCA building, and the historic district, will be preserved. The Project conforms to Standard 10.

Preservation Briefs 14 states: “A new addition must preserve significant historic materials, features and form, and it must be compatible but differentiated from the historic building. To achieve this, it is necessary to carefully consider the placement or location of the new addition, and its size, scale and massing when planning a new addition. ...Inherent in all of the guidance is the concept that an addition needs to be subordinate to the historic building.”

As previously stated, the Project will retain and rehabilitate significant historic materials, features and form, and the new building will be compatible but differentiated from the historic YWCA building.

As suggested in the guidance, the new construction will not obscure any primary façades and will retain existing spatial configurations. The L-shaped new building will be placed to the south and east of the YWCA building, adjacent to the secondary facades and retain the existing central courtyard. The new building will not abut the existing building and will be a separate volume except for a bridge connection at the northeast corner.

The proposed new building will be taller than the existing YWCA, but will have a smaller footprint. It will be shorter than the adjacent City Hall and other buildings within the historic district. It will balance differentiation of building design with compatible massing and proportion, located and scaled to be subordinate to the adjacent historic buildings.

The new construction will not result in a substantial adverse impact on the site or on existing adjacent resources.

6.6 Analytical Summary

Analysis of potential impacts to historical resources reveals that the Project will alter the setting and surroundings of historical resources, but that the alteration will not substantially reduce the integrity or significance of those resources. The following discussion reiterates the findings of the historical impacts analysis using the thresholds provided in the State CEQA Guidelines.

Demolition

The Project will not demolish a significant historical resource. The Project will replace the existing surface parking lot on the Project Site. The Project will also remove a small portion of public landscape area that has been

44 Grimmer and Weeks, “Preservation Briefs 14.”
present since construction of the Civic Center began in the late 1920s. Although the project will remove a small portion of landscaped area that has been a feature of the Civic Center throughout its existence, this loss will not reduce the overall integrity of the Civic Center Historic District such that its historic significance will be threatened. All of the contributing buildings to the Historic District will remain intact, as will the street pattern, sidewalks, parkways and the majority of its landscape areas. The Civic Center Historic District will continue to convey its historic significance.

The Project does not propose or anticipate demolition of the Pasadena YWCA, the U.S. Post Office, City Hall or any other contributing building to the District. The Project will alter the setting of both the YWCA building and the District, but they will retain their integrity and remain eligible for historic designation. The Project does not involve demolition of a significant resource.

**Relocation**

The Project would not relocate any significant historical resource on or in the vicinity of the Project Site. The Project will not relocate any part of the Pasadena YWCA or any contributing building of the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District. Therefore, the Project does not include the relocation of any historic resource.

**Conversion, rehabilitation or alteration**

The Project will rehabilitate the Pasadena YWCA, which is listed in the National Register as a contributor to the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District, and is a designated historic monument by the City of Pasadena. Without appropriate mitigation to ensure that rehabilitation of the Pasadena YWCA will conform to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, the project has the potential to result in a significant impact.

The Project would also construct a six-story building on land currently used for surface parking and as a public landscape area. The addition of the new building will alter the existing spatial relationships within the District and remove a portion of the landscaped open space between Holly and Union streets at the east end of the project site. These alterations, however, will not reduce the integrity of any historic resources such that the historic significance of these resources is threatened. The Pasadena YWCA, City Hall, the U.S. Post Office and all of the contributing buildings to the District will remain unaltered by the Project. The street pattern, sidewalks and majority of landscape areas that characterize the District will also remain intact.
Construction that reduces the integrity or significance of important resources on the site or in the vicinity

As stated previously, the Project will partially obscure secondary facades of a historical resource that were previously open to public view. Construction of the new building will remove a portion of the landscape area between Holly and Union Streets and alter the symmetrical arrangement of landscape areas that mirror each other on both sides of Holly Street facing City Hall. The height and placement of the new building will also alter some sightlines within the District. These impacts, however, will not substantially reduce the integrity or significance of important resources on the site or in the vicinity. As such, the adjacent resources would remain eligible for listing.

6.7 Conclusions

Analysis of the potential impacts to historical resources has found that rehabilitation of the Pasadena YWCA has the potential to result in a significant impact without mitigation to ensure that the rehabilitation will be conducted in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District, and the impact would be less than significant.

The Project will also insert new construction on land that was previously used for surface parking and as an open landscape area. These alterations, however, will not result in substantial adverse changes in the significance of the Pasadena YWCA or...
7.0 RECOMMENDED MITIGATION AND CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

The following mitigation measure would protect historic resources from potential impacts associated with the Project:

1. The applicant will engage a historic preservation consultant that meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Professional Qualifications Standards to oversee the design development for compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*. Design development will also be guided by the 2011 *Pasadena YWCA Rehabilitation Study* prepared for the City of Pasadena by Architectural Resources Group. The historic preservation consultant will conduct on-site construction monitoring throughout the construction phase. The historic preservation consultant will submit monthly written progress memoranda confirming *Standards* compliance and a final report prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy by the City.

The following conditions of approval would further protect historic resources associated with the Project:

1. The Project shall include an onsite interpretive display commemorating the history of the Pasadena YWCA and its historic significance. This display may include historic photos, drawings and text. The content and design of the interpretive display shall be reviewed and approved by the Design Commission prior to installation and installation shall occur prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy.

2. The Pasadena YWCA building shall be photographed to document the existing condition for the historic record prior to issuance of a building permit for any demolition, abatement or rehabilitation work. Documentation shall include large format (4” x 5” negative or larger) photographs in accordance with Historic American Buildings Survey (HABS) guidelines (both prints and digital files). Views shall include all exterior elevations for each building, important interior features, key spatial relationships among buildings, and exterior hardscape features. Building plans and a photo key shall accompany the photographs.

One original copy of the documentation as specified above shall be assembled and sent to the Southern California Information Center at California State University Fullerton. One set shall be provided to the City of Pasadena Design & Historic Preservation archive. One additional set shall be offered to and, if accepted, deposited in the archives of the Pasadena Museum.
of History. One additional set shall be offered to and, if accepted, deposited in the Pasadena Public Library.
8.0 CONCLUSION

It was determined that historical resources as defined by CEQA are present on, and adjacent to, the Project Site. The Project Site is located within the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District. The Project will adaptively re-use the former Pasadena YWCA, a contributor to the District and a designated Pasadena historic monument. The Project will also construct a new building immediately adjacent to the Pasadena YWCA.

With the recommended mitigation measures contained herein, the proposed Project has no substantial adverse impacts to the historic resources because overall the Pasadena YWCA building and the Pasadena Civic Center Historic District would retain sufficient integrity to convey their significance and remain eligible for listing in the National Register and/or the California Register and as a City of Pasadena historic monument. Conditions of Approval are recommended to further protect historic resources associated with the project.
SOURCES

2013 California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Statute and Guidelines; California Association of Environmental Professionals, www.califaep.org


California Public Resources Code (Sections 21000-21177).

California Code of Regulations, (Title 14, Division 6, Chapter 3, Sections 15000-15387).

City of Pasadena Design and Historic Preservation Services; architecture and address files.


City of Pasadena Planning and Community Development Department. Memorandum “Summary & Analysis of ‘Report on a Plan for the City of Pasadena, California’ by Bennett, Parsons & Frost, 1925.” March 26, 2015.

City of Pasadena Planning and Community Development website, http://www.ci.pasadena.ca.us/planning/


Los Angeles Times, ProQuest Historical Newspapers; 1897-1924.


Pasadena Museum of History Research Library and Archives; www.pasadenahistory.org

Pasadena YWCA
Historic Resources Technical Report
October 2015
HISTORIC RESOURCES GROUP
Pasadena Public Library; Pasadena News Index to *Pasadena Evening Star and Pasadena Daily News*.

Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps for Pasadena; 1887-1951.

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation;
http://www.nps.gov/hps/tps/standguide/rehab/rehab_standards.htm

APPENDIX A: PROJECT SITE EXISTING CONDITIONS PHOTOGRAPHS

78 North Marengo Avenue (Project Site); Pasadena YWCA at southeast corner of Marengo Avenue and Holly Street, looking southeast

78 North Marengo Avenue (Project Site); Pasadena YWCA at northeast corner of Marengo Avenue and Union Street, looking northeast

Pasadena YWCA
Historic Resources Technical Report
October 2015

HISTORIC RESOURCES GROUP
78 North Marengo Avenue (Project Site); southwest corner of Garfield Avenue and Holly Street, looking southwest

78 North Marengo Avenue (Project Site); northwest corner of Garfield Avenue and Union Street, looking northwest

Pasadena YWCA
Historic Resources Technical Report
October 2015
HISTORIC RESOURCES GROUP
78 North Marengo Avenue (Project frontage along Holly Street); looking east from Marengo Avenue

78 North Marengo Avenue (Project frontage along Holly Street); looking west from Garfield Avenue
78 North Marengo Avenue (Project Site); looking south on Garfield Avenue from Holly Street

78 North Marengo Avenue (Project Site); looking north on Garfield Avenue from Union Street
78 North Marengo Avenue (Project Site); looking northwest from Union Street and Garfield Avenue

78 North Marengo Avenue (Project Site); looking southwest from Holly Street and Garfield Avenue
Pasadena YWCA
Historic Resources Technical Report
October 2015
HISTORIC RESOURCES GROUP
(D) 125-137 North Marengo Avenue (American Legion)

(C) 95 North Marengo Avenue (Turner & Stevens Co.)

Pasadena YWCA
Historic Resources Technical Report
October 2015

HISTORIC RESOURCES GROUP
(E) 75 North Marengo Avenue (First Baptist Church)

Civic Center Financial District (Marengo Avenue)
Figure C-1: West (primary) façade of Pasadena YWCA, ca. 1930.
Figure C-2: West (primary) façade of Pasadena YWCA, 1938. (USC Digital Libraries)
Figure C.3: Dining Room at Pasadena YWCA, ca. 1940. (USC Digital Libraries)
Figure C-4: East courtyard at Pasadena YWCA, ca. 1940. (USC Digital Libraries)
Figure C-5: Concept City Plan proposed by Bennett, Parsons & Frost in 1923.
“Pasadena, California Location Plan of Proposed Public Buildings with their Approaches”
Figure C-6: “Pasadena Civic Building Group General Plan” by Bennett, Parsons & Frost, March 1925/April 1926.
Figure C-7: Detail of “Pasadena Civic Building Group General Plan” by Bennett, Parsons & Frost, March 1925/April 1926, showing vicinity of City Hall.